To the Lord Mayor and Members of Dublin City Council Report No. 153/2017 Report of the Assistant Chief Executive



# Submission under Section 37E(4) of the Planning and Development Acts 2000 to 2010 in relation to the proposed development of a new National Maternity Hospital at St. Vincent's University Hospital Campus, Elm Park, D04 T6F4.

Please find attached the report of the Executive in relation to the proposed National Maternity Hospital at St. Vincent's University Hospital Campus, Elm Park, D04 T6F4.

Overall, the Planning Authority has concluded that the proposed development is compliant with national and regional planning policy, the policies, objectives and development standards of the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022. In the event of permission being granted by An Bord Pleanála, the Planning Authority requests that the Board attach a number of conditions as set out in the end of the report.

Members of the Council may by resolution submit comments to An Bord Pleanála, which will be appended to the Executive's Report.

## **Table of Contents**

- 1.0 Introduction
- 2.0 Description of Proposed Development
- 3.0 Recent Planning History
- 4.0 Site Description and Capacity
- 5.0 Alternatives
- 6.0 Assessment of the Proposal
- 7.0 Conclusion
- 8.0 Recommended Conditions

#### Appendices – Internal Dublin City Council Reports

- Appendix 1 Roads and Traffic Planning Division Report
- Appendix 2 City Architects Report
- Appendix 3 Waste Regulation Section Report
- Appendix 4 Air Quality Monitoring and Noise Control Division Report
- Appendix 5 Drainage Division Report

#### 1.0 INTRODUCTION

The Health Service Executive (HSE) has submitted an application to An Bord Pleanála under Section 37E of the Planning and Development Act 2000 (as amended), for the development of a new National Maternity Hospital at the St. Vincent's University Hospital Campus, Elm Park, Dublin 4, D04T6F4.

The Government has committed to the development of a new National Maternity Hospital (NMH) on the site of St. Vincent's University Hospital (SVUH) Campus to facilitate the provision of a comprehensive model of maternity, gynaecology and neonatal service in a state of the art, custom built modern health care facility providing care to international standards to meet the needs of the Greater Dublin Area and the national population.

It was in May 2013 that the government announced its intention to relocate the existing NMH from its current location on Holles Street Dublin 2 to the St. Vincent's University Hospital Campus, Elm Park, Dublin 4. The stated intention of the relocation of the National Maternity Hospital from its current location to SVUH campus was to address a key recommendation of an independent review and international best practice that maternity hospitals should be co-located alongside adult acute services. The government's plan was supported further by the preparation of the National Maternity Strategy 2016-2022 which sets out a vision for maternity services where "Women and babies have access to safe, high quality care in a setting that is most appropriate to their needs; women and families are placed at the centre of all services and are treated with dignity, respect and compassion; parents are supported before, during and after pregnancy to allow them to give their child the best possible start in life".

As detailed in the applicant's submission the current maternity hospital at Holles Street, Dublin 2 exists on an inadequate site with the last major expansion occurring in the 1930's. Parts of the building date back to the 18<sup>th</sup> century, creating major infrastructural challenges including overcrowding and a lack of basic facilities creating serious difficulties in the day-to-day delivery of high-risk services. In addition the number of births has increased by over 50% in the NMH over the past 20 years. Currently, in the context of severe maternal morbidity or complex disease, NMH relies on accessing intensive care and other surgical facilities at SVUH which involves the transfer of very ill women across the city creating additional hazard to their wellbeing. Therefore, close proximity to the range of healthcare facilities that might be required has the potential to significantly enhance the care that the NMH presently delivers.

As requested by An Bord Pleanála in a letter dated 10<sup>th</sup> March 2017 Dublin City Council hereby submits the views of the Council on the effects of the proposed development on the environment and the proper planning and sustainable development of the area. The report relates only to those parts of the proposal which are located within the Dublin City Council administrative area at the St. Vincent's University Hospital Campus, Elm Park, Dublin 4.

The proposal is assessed under the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022. The report is broken down into the following elements:

- 1.0 Introduction
- 2.0 Description of Proposed Development
- 3.0 Recent Planning History
- 4.0 Site Description and Capacity

- 5.0 Alternatives
- 6.0 Assessment of the Proposal
- 7.0 Conclusion
- 8.0 Recommended Conditions

## 2.0 DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT

The applicants are seeking a 10-year permission for the development of the new National Maternity Hospital, comprising: a 244 no. bed maternity hospital; developments for St. Vincent's University Hospital (including 38 no. in-patient beds) to replace existing facilities on site; new campus-wide shared non-clinical support facilities; a shared service yard, an extension to the existing multi-storey car park and all ancillary site development, site services, utilities and landscaping services.

The new development, including the expanded car park, will add approximately 62,660 sq.m. of new development area to the campus, bringing the total development on site to 189,308 sq.m.

The proposed development comprises 8 principal elements, broadly:

(I) The construction of a new 50,776 sq.m. gross floor area building adjacent to and connected with the existing St. Vincent's Clinical Services building. The new structure provides for the National Maternity Hospital. The building will rise to five and six storeys plus additional roof plant areas and a basement (overall height to parapet level of 41.285m ODM to top of lift shaft plant room).

Also replacement facilities for St. Vincent's University Hospital Bridge/corridor links are proposed to the existing Clinical Services building and existing ward block

- (II) The expansion of the existing multi-storey car park (11,884 sq.m.); two levels vertically and a five-level extension at its western end adjacent to Nutley Lane to an overall height of 18.84ODM to top of lift shaft
- (III) Temporary buildings (903 sq.m.) to include staff changing facilities, household services store, carpenters' workshop and canteen (all single storey)
- (IV) Two new entrances to the multi-storey car park
- (V) The demolition of existing buildings comprising 8,765 sq.m. including the existing canteen, catering staff facilities, transitional care unit, neurology unit pharmacy, energy centre including the existing chimney stack, carpenters' workshop, electrical switch room, kitchens, purchasing stores, dermatology unit, waste marshalling yard and the nissen hut
- (VI) The construction of a new single-storey ESB substation, switch room (119 sq.m.), and oil tank enclosure, two new single-storey bicycle store enclosures for 192 bicycle spaces, a new single storey VIE enclosure (91 sq.m.) and a new single storey storage building (110 sq.m.)
- (VII) Modifications to the existing road network within the campus, hard and soft landscaping elements, and modifications to existing road junctions
- (VIII) All ancillary site clearance, construction, site development and landscaping works

The two principle buildings proposed in the application are (a) the National Maternity Hospital building, and (b) the extended carpark. The proposed development is proposed to be constructed in a sequential manner allowing for the continual operation of the hospital campus and includes the phased demolition of existing buildings.

## National Maternity Hospital Building

The proposed maternity hospital building is proposed to have a 50,766sq.m. gross floor area (total above ground area is 45,091 sq.m.) and will provide a 244 no. bed National Maternity Hospital to be relocated from Holles Street, Dublin 2. The building is split into two blocks: a six-storey block running east to west, following the mass and building line of the existing Clinical Services building connected to a 6-storey block running perpendicular to this on a north south-axis. The main entrance is located between these two blocks and the space between these blocks accommodates a new central atrium and landscaped courtyards. The courtyards are intended as spaces for the provision of space for families' relaxation and play.

The new building will connect with the existing 5-storey Clinical Services building via new bridges/link corridors at levels 0, 2, 3 and 4 and will include modifications to the existing laboratories within the existing hospital. The proposed link between the operating theatres at Level 4 is described by the applicant as the most critical link with the other links provided at the other levels in order to support the co-location needs of both hospitals and to provide the infrastructure for further links in the future. The links at level 0 and 4 will be at grade, whereas there will be a change in level at the level 2 and 3 connections with pass through lifts accommodating the level change.

The applicant has emphasised in the application the fundamental design requirements of co-location stating that as a clinical level the direct link between adult and maternity theatres is what realises the fundamental objectives of co-location. On this particular site this co-location requirement positions the new NMH directly adjacent (to the east) of the existing Clinical Services Building. This need to physically link the two buildings is, as stated by the applicant, the cornerstone of the design with the Theatre Suite in the new hospital planned directly adjacent to the St. Vincent's University Hospital Theatre and Critical Care Department and at exactly the same level on Level 4 with all other aspects of the proposed building designed relative to these critical links (including floor levels). The Design Report accompanying the applicant provides for a comprehensive description of the extent of the co-location and design requirements.

The new hospital building will include the following medical and surgical specialities – maternity, gynaecology, paediatrics, neonatology, pathology, genetics, anaesthesia, emergency medicine, endocrinology/diabetes, pain management, oncology, colposcopy, urodynamics, fetal medicine and haematology.

The proposed building also comprises developments for St. Vincent's University Hospital to replace existing facilities on site including 2 no. SVHU wards (38 no. inpatient beds), new dermatology unit, SVUH medical records department, finance department offices, and shared facilities including a waste marshalling yard, deliveries yard, purchasing and stores department, catering department and canteen, clinical engineering and hospital services department.

<u>Height:</u> The proposed hospital building will range in height from 5 storeys plus plant adjacent to the SVUH Clinical Services block (east-west axis) to 6 storeys plus plant on the north-south axis block. The building will be a maximum of 6 no. storeys with basement and additional plant level. The floor levels of the new building will align with the levels with the existing clinical services block at level 0 (+6.00OD) and at level 4 (+23.69OD). At its highest point the proposed hospital building will rise to a maximum overall height of approximately 35m to top of stair core (from a selected ground level

of +6m ODM). Floor to floor heights will be evenly distributed between these levels at 4.4m. The total above ground floor area of the hospital building is proposed at 45,091 sq.m. The floor levels will of the new building will align with the levels within SVUH at level 0 (+6.00OD) and at level 4 (+23.69OD).

<u>Terraces/Gardens/Courtyards</u>: The proposal includes a large number of gardens, courtyards and accessible high-level terraces within the development to be utilised by patients, staff and visitors to the hospital. Parts of the hospital building are also proposed with a green roof i.e. on that part of the block running in an east-west direction while the north-south block volume is proposed to accommodate the set-back plant at roof level.

<u>Public Realm:</u> The main entrance to the proposed National Maternity Hospital building will be clearly defined along the main SVUH campus spine road by the provision of a forecourt addressing a new central plaza within the hospital campus. The taller L-shaped corner block to the northeast of the proposed hospital will also frame the entrance to the hospital with a canopy and colonnade adjacent. This entrance provides access into a central atrium which is located between the two new blocks proposed as part of the National Maternity Hospital building

<u>Façade / Materials</u>: As described above the building has been broken into two volumes. In brief, two types of façade treatment used - (i) the more solid areas are proposed to be finished in granite and (ii) the circulation areas that separate the two volumes, as well as the high level bridge links, are to be treated as an aluminium and glass curtain wall system.

<u>Below ground level/Basement Level</u>: The proposed maternity hospital building will have one below-ground level (Level -1) accommodating supporting clinical and supporting spaces including offices, meeting rooms, resource rooms, staff changing facilities, bed management room, boiler and water storage rooms etc

## • Extension to the Multi-Storey Car Park

An extension is also proposed to the existing multi-storey car park consisting of an additional 2 no. levels above the existing 3-storey car park plus a 5-storey extension at its western end adjacent to Nutley Lane. This extension will result in a net increase of 277 no. spaces on the campus in addition to 149 no. displace spaces to accommodate a total of 922 spaces over five levels.

#### • Modifications to Road Network

Modifications are proposed to the existing road network within the campus to accommodate the new hospital building and car parking facilities. Hard and soft landscaping is also proposed to the perimeter of the proposed building including modification of ground levels. The existing road junctions at Nutley Lane and Merrion Road are also proposed to be modified along with a temporary construction access and general landscaping modifications to campus access routes.

A new underground access is also to be provided to the proposed extended multistorey car park via an existing car park is proposed (via St. Rita's) which involves closing the access to St. Rita's car park and providing a new entrance slightly west of it. In addition a new entrance to the multi-storey car park at level 6 is to be provided, replacing the existing entrance at level 2. Two managed vehicular set down areas are to be located outside the entrance to the new hospital (one on either side of the road to cater for vehicles from both directions), along with a dedicated emergency access area.

Modifications are proposed to the existing Herbert Wing car park including access ramp and steps to the new building and an ambulance set down area to the southern elevation.

Two new bicycle parking enclosures are proposed (170 sq.m. and 158 sq.m.) providing parking for 192 bicycles.

The proposal also involves the construction of a single-storey ESB substation, switch room (119 sq.m.), and oil tank enclosure (236 sq.m.); and a storage building (110 sq.m.);

#### • Demolitions:

The proposed development includes the demolition of existing buildings on site comprising 8,765 sq.m. of space to facilitate clearing of the site for the proposed new hospital building and includes the demolition of the canteen, carpenters' workshop and household services store (all single storey).

• Ancillary Works The proposed development also includes all ancillary site clearance, construction, site development and landscaping works, which include but are not limited to: the relocation of medical and surgical gasses, the diversion of existing hospital campus site services, new and replacement cycle spaces, new services, water mains and communications networks and all required phasing, sequencing and site development works.

A Design Report has been submitted with the application and provides an overview of the proposed development, focusing on the design proposal for the proposed development on the hospital site. The report covers the site context and architectural proposals for the hospital, as well as the integrated proposals for landscaping, fire, universal access and sustainability.

#### 3.0 RECENT PLANNING HISTORY

There is an extensive planning history associated with St. Vincent's University Hospital, which is set out in documentation from 1997 to present in the Planning Application Form – Schedule 1, and in Appendix 3.1 of the EIS. The re-development of the hospital complex was permitted by 1575/98 and included the construction of the multi-storey car park which is also the subject of an extension under the current application.

Dublin City Council considers the following recent planning applications to be of particular relevance to the current proposal:

**Dublin City Council Reg. Ref. 3876/15:** Planning permission was granted by the Planning Authority on 29/01/2016 for a new pharmacy facility ancillary to the principal hospital use at roof level of the existing Main Ward Block in the form of a new 2 and 3 storey structure. a new link to the existing Clinical Services Block at level 4; the relocation of existing disabled car parking spaces; and, all associated alterations, site development works and site services.

**Dublin City Council Reg. Ref. 3117/07:** Planning permission was granted by the Planning Authority on 27/02/2008 to construct an eight storey in-patient ward building including plant level comprising of 5 floors of ward accommodation (100) beds, a floor of day ward (20 beds), a ground floor level of administrative and support accommodation, and basement plant room, linking to the main hospital street at ground floor level. The works formed a part the development of the hospitals facilities and are located at third, fourth and plant floor levels of the original main ward block.

**Dublin City Council Reg. Ref: 1687/07:** Planning permission was granted by the Planning Authority on 11/05/2007 for two storey roof top infill extension with plant level, comprising of 4 operating theatres and clinical support accommodation, linking to the new main clinical block at third, fourth and plant level and associated minor works

**Dublin City Council Reg. Ref. 5120/06; An Bord Pleanála Ref 223111:** Planning permission was granted by the Planning Authority and upheld on appeal to An Bord Pleanála on 31/10/2007 for a private hospital ranging in height from 3 to 8 storeys (with plant at roof level on the eight floor) within the St. Vincent's University Hospital Campus know as St. Anthony's and located at the southern end of Herbert Avenue, Dublin 4

**Dublin City Council Reg. Ref. 1575/98; An Bord Pleanála Ref 109451:** Planning permission was granted by the Planning Authority and upheld on appeal to An Bord Pleanála on 08/06/1999 for the first phase of the redevelopment of facilities at Elm Park, Dublin 4 consisting of a new 5 storey over basement building, built to the front (north) of and linked to the main hospital block. Development also included a screened landscape split-level partially sunken carpark (part 2 storey, part 3 storey) to accommodate approximately 500 cars to the northern perimeter of the site replacing existing surface car parking in this area.

## 4.0 SITE DESCRIPTION AND CAPACITY

## 4.1 SITE DESCRIPTION

The St. Vincent's Hospital University Campus is a strategic healthcare facility located in the south east of the city in the neighbourhood of Merrion, having transferred to its present site in Elm Park in 1970. The application site is bounded to the northeast and northwest by Nutley Lane and Merrion Road respectively, by mainly residential development along Herbert Avenue to the east, and by Elm Park golf course to the southeast and southwest. There are a number of existing developments along the Merrion Road and Nutley Lane, many of a campus type character.

The immediate surrounding lands uses include the retail centre at Merrion Shopping Centre, institutional and offices uses at RTE and Elm Park Business Campus, educational use at St. Michael's College, residential development on Merrion Road, Nutley Lane and Herbert Avenue alongside some small scale commercial development and open space (Elm Park golf course).

The hospital campus is located on a large site of 11.9 hectares (this area includes the 8-storey private hospital), sloping from south to north with the ground levels falling from approximately +10.00m Ordnance Datum along the south and falling to approximately +04.0m Ordnance Datum at the north close to Merrion Road. The ground levels in the area proposed for the new Maternity Hospital are described as changing across the site and found to have significant influence on setting out the

optimum floor level strategy for the new building. This sloping nature of the site has also impacted upon the setting of levels in the SVUH Clinical Services Block which has an entrance 800mm lower than level 0 in the rest of the SVUH hospital.

The site of the planning application measures 10.55ha. The site contains over 36 buildings in various states of repair and capacity with the existing buildings comprising a total of 135,413m<sup>2</sup> at a plot ratio of 1:14. The height of existing buildings on the campus vary from single-storey structures to the 8-storey private hospital building which stands at 35.5m (plus 3m to the top of the flues). <u>Note:</u> This 8-storey private hospital located at the southern end of Herbert Avenue is not included within the red line boundary of the application site but it is indicated on the planning drawings as being within the ownership of the applicant by way of a blue line boundary. In addition, the recently constructed Nutley Wing is a 7-storey over basement building with a height of approximately 29m to parapet level.

Building heights on the campus range from single-storey ancillary buildings through to two to five storey original hospital buildings and eight storey plus plant private hospital buildings. There is a hub of low lying primarily non-clinical support buildings at the eastern end of the campus adjacent to the Clinical Services building which provide for energy, catering, delivery, facilities management and waste management support services to the campus. The majority of these are proposed for demolition and it is in this location the new maternity hospital is to be built. The area is bounded to the north by the main internal access road, to the east by the road to the St. Vincent's Private Hospital and to the south by the Herbert Wing surface car park.

There are no protected structures within the hospital campus site but the site is bounded to the east by Herbert Avenue which is zoned Z1 (residential) and Z2 (residential conservation area) in the current development plan for the city. There are a number of protected structures on Estate Avenue further to the east, although these are screened from the Campus by Herbert Avenue.

There are two main vehicular entrances to the campus: one at Merrion Road to the east of the campus and the second at Nutley Lane to the west, connected to each other by an internal campus road.

Car parking facilities are distributed throughout the campus. Underground car parks are provided under the St. Vincent's Private Hospital and the Clinical Services building. Surface car parks and the multi-storey car parks are to the north of the internal road with a number of surface parking areas adjacent to the Herbert Wing, ED entrance and Dermatology entrance, all of which are located to the south of the internal room.

The site is relatively open along its northern boundary to the Merrion Road with a dedicated pedestrian access from the Merrion Road providing good pedestrian connections to the nearby DART station and bus services along Merrion Road. There is a good network of public footpaths provided within the campus.

Over the last ten years the campus has undergone significant development which includes a new Clinical Services building and main entrance at the centre of the Campus, a new 3-storey car park to the north, a Breast Check Clinic to the east off Merrion Road, a new ward block (the Nutley Wing) to the southwestern end of the campus and the private hospital at the easternmost part of the campus. The existing multi-storey car park is located along the north-western perimeter of the campus addressing Nutley Lane. It is proposed to extend at its western end.

As the hospital campus has developed it has become increasingly dominated by buildings, roads and hard surfaces. Nevertheless the campus has retained a sense of landscaped elements being integrated into more recent developments.

## 4.2 SITE CAPACITY AND FUTURE EXPANSION

As stated by the applicants the overarching aim for the campus is to capitalise on SVUH's inherent strengths as a hospital and facilitate the modernisation and expansion of its clinical and research activities within the co-location model, a clinical model that aims to bring together adult and maternity services and represents international best practice for maternity services with proven outcomes in terms of health outcomes, clinical synergies and the fostering of research.

A Site Capacity Study was carried out, and is included with the application, to test how the current proposal could be successfully completed without compromising the future development needs of the remainder of the campus, notably the redevelopment of the adult hospital over time. The study is included with the application (Volume 05.3). The study is an indication of the potential capacity of the campus rather that a development plan for same. It is envisaged by the applicant that the total area envisaged for the long term development of the Adult Hospital; Maternity Hospital and the future expansion of both services into the future is 265,879 sq.m. with approx. 130,350 sq.m. of this to be development in opportunity zones. The study identifies these 6 additional key opportunity zones - Zone 1: The site of the existing 4-sotrey Herbert Wing and ancillary buildings); Zone 2 / Zone 3: The site of the existing 1970 five-storey St. Vincent's Hospital Building; Zone 4 : The site directly to the west of the 8-storey Nutley Wing: Zone 5: The St. Rita's site; and Zone 6: The site in and around the existing two-storey Breastcheck and Carew House buildings. Accounting for the demolition of 51,000 sq.m. of existing older buildings in these zones, the nett additional capacity realised is 79,341 sq.m. A number of alternative phasing scenarios have also been presented, offering contrasting starting and end points to demonstrate some of the potential permutations and test the flexibility of the design vision.

## 5.0 ALTERNATIVES

The application provides an overview of alternative sites, designs and processes that have been considered in the process which culminated in the decision to develop the new National Maternity Hospital at SVUH campus. Chapter 4 of the accompanying EIS and Section 3.1.4 of the Planning Report submitted with the application summarise the site selection and design processes undertaken in the process.

#### Alternative Sites:

A decision was made at Government level to locate the new NMH at SVUH campus following extensive research, investment and analysis. Reports produced included the KPMG Report "Independent Review of Maternity and Gynaecology Services in the Greater Dublin Area (2008) and a review of the KPMG report "Re-location of the Commbe and Rotunda Hospitals (2012). Through this body of work an examination of alternative locations for the NMH was undertaken. The 2008 report recommended that the NMH services at Holles Street move to SVUH campus while the 2012 report (review) endorsed the reports findings. The Government's Capital Plan "Building on Recovery: Infrastructure and Capital Investment 2016-2021" confirmed the funding allocation for the relocation of Dublin maternity hospitals and states that "The National Maternity Hospital will be relocated to the St. Vincent's Campus".

#### Alternative Designs:

The submission outlines the design options stating that throughout the design process the design team development and tested various options for the design of the new building that considered the following:

- Building form and plan
- Building footprint
- Building Height
- Building Massing Studies

The applicant considered the 'do nothing' option: Meaning there would be no new NMH and in turn no resultant upgrading of maternity services with these services continuing to be provided at the existing NMH at Holles Street.

#### 6.0 ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPOSAL

#### 6.1 DEVELOPMENT PLAN CONTEXT – VISION AND CORE STRATEGY

The statutory planning policy context for the St. Vincent's University Hospital site is the Dublin City Development Plan 2016 - 2022 which came into effect on 21<sup>st</sup> October 2016. The vision for the City set out in the Development Plan is that:

Within the next 25 to 30 years, Dublin will have an established international reputation as one of the most sustainable, dynamic and resourceful city regions in Europe. Dublin, through the shared vision of its citizens and civic leaders, will be a beautiful, compact city, with a distinct character, a vibrant culture and a diverse, smart, green, innovation-based economy. It will be a socially inclusive city of urban neighbourhoods, all connected by an exemplary public transport, cycling and walking system and interwoven with a quality bio-diverse greenspace network. In short, the vision is for a capital city where people will seek to live, work and experience as a matter of choice.

Our 30 year vision is for a zero carbon city with all energy coming from renewable energy sources. All buildings will have been built or retrofitted to near zero energy building standards, which will provide comfortable, warm living environments. We will have the use of 'conventially-fuelled' cars in urban transport by 2030 and phase them out by 2050; achieve essential c02-free city logistics in Dublin by 2030.. Within 30 years we will move close to zero fatalities in road transport. In line with this goal we will aim to halve road casualties by 2022. This Council will work with its neighbouring local authorities and the National Transport Agency to achieve a doubling of all active traffic and public transport trips and to halve private vehicular trips to Dublin by 2030.

The Dublin City Development Plan is guided by National and Regional planning policies as set out in the National Spatial Strategy and the Regional Planning Guidelines for the Greater Dublin Area. It is the shared aim of these plans to consolidate and strengthen the role of Dublin as the main economic engine of the State, and in particular to consolidate development proximate to public transport routes. These higher level policy documents together with the vision for the City form the basis for the Core Strategy of the Development Plan, which can be translated into three strongly interwoven strands:

- (a) a compact, quality, green, connected city;
- (b) a prosperous, enterprising, creative city and

(c) creating sustainable neighbourhoods and communities.

The ultimate aim of the development plan is social, providing for people's needs in all aspects of their lives and across their life cycles in a sustainable manner. This is reflected in the three principles of the core strategy and in every chapter of the development plan.

#### A compact, quality, green, connected city

The proposed development supports the creation of 'a compact, quality, green, connected city'. The existing hospital campus is under-developed in the city context, with the majority of structures on the site of a two and three storey nature which result in a relatively low-density environment. As such, it does not make optimum use of scare urban land or make adequate use of existing public transport infrastructure.

The development offers a major opportunity to maximise the use of a scarce resource – land. The St. Vincent's University Hospital campus is also ideally located to avail of key public transport infrastructure with the hospital well served in terms of linkages to public transport including the Dart Station at Sydney Parade and frequent bus services along Merrion Road. In addition pedestrian and cyclists are well catered for with dedicated facilities in the vicinity of the campus as well as on the campus itself.

The proposed development also opens up the possibility of creating a greener and more connected city through the development of improved pedestrian, cycle and vehicular routes through the campus and the immediate surrounds, the delivery of additional pedestrian connections and the provision of additional secure cycling parking. A Mobility Management Strategy has been submitted. As noted in the RTPD report received this strategy includes detailed measures to promote walking, cycle and use of public transport to the campus. The continued active promotion of mobility management measures is welcomed. The applicant has demonstrated that there is a proactive mobility management approach on campus. Dublin City Council will work closely with the overall campus to continue to promote modal split. The campus is also an active partner in the NTA Smarter Travel workplaces programme.

The landscape design provides for a variety of open spaces ranging from fully public to semi-private. The most prominent of these is the main entrance forecourt proposed to the immediate north/front of the new NMH. This plaza is deemed appropriate in scale, design and materials to the proposed new hospital building and will act as a central anchor space for the entire hospital campus when fully developed (as outlined in the Site Capacity Study).

The development proposes to upgrade a number of existing access routes into the hospital campus to improve permeability. The creation of a new additional access route and entrance to the multi-storey car parking block off Merrion Road is well-considered and will facilitate the amenity of the new Main Entrance Plaza, by removing through traffic running across the main SVUH campus spine road. The provision of a new cycle lane to run adjacent to the existing 'boulevard' north-south public pedestrian route will also facilitate improved access to the hospital campus, linking the intersection of Merrion Road, Nutley Lane and Merrion Shopping Centre to the north with the new Main Entrance Plaza within the hospital campus to the south.

The provision of new gardens and courtyards will assist in the creation of a greener city. A feeling of maturity and permanence will also result by the applicant's planting of semi-mature trees of varying height and form. Improvements to vehicular, cyclist

and pedestrian movement on the hospital campus will assist in the delivery of a traffic-calmed high quality public realm in this area.

The application has been considered by DCC's City Architect's Division and it is considered that due consideration has been given to universal access requirements in the design of the scheme

#### A prosperous, enterprising, creative city

It is a core aim of the City Development Plan to promote economic development, enterprise and employment generation in the city, consolidating and strengthening the role of Dublin as the main economic engine in the state and putting Dublin at the heart of the region. It is a priority of the plan. The development plan includes as a priority an objective to facilitate the development of sustainable employment in a number of areas including healthcare, innovation, science, academic research and leading technologies.

It is crucial to ensure the development of a dynamic city region with sufficient critical mass in order to compete at an international level and fulfil its role as the national gateway and key economic driver of growth for the Greater Dublin region and the country as a whole. Sustainable economic development, and enterprise and employment generation is one of the three elements of the core strategy and a successful city economy both relies on and contributes to the other two core elements.

The city plan, in response to some of the key planning issues facing the city, identifies the development of institutional clusters within the city centre to optimise its economic potential. The plan recognises the strategic role of hospital complexes in the city, and highlights the importance of facilitating the development of the National Maternity Hospital having regard to its national medical function, its role as a major employer in the city, a generator or significant economic benefits and a promoter of the knowledge economy through research and education links with third-level colleges in the city.

The health sector is one of the City's specialisms and the consolidation of this use within the St. Vincent's University Hospital campus will be a significant economic and employment generator within an existing medical cluster in line with the vision, core strategy of the city development plan and policies of the city development plan as set out above.

#### **Creating Sustainable Neighbourhoods and Communities**

The final strand of the city's core strategy is the creation of a 'Sustainable Neighbourhoods and Communities'.

The creation of good neighbourhoods which support thriving communities, provide for a wide range of household types with community facilities nearby is a priority of the plan. Specifically the development plan puts an emphasis on institutional lands as an important resource for the city in providing community and health facilities, for both the city and local neighbourhoods with the plan protecting these lands as a strategic asset for the city.

The ongoing development of the St. Vincent's University Campus as a centre of medical excellence with ancillary educational, research and IT specialisms will continue to support the economic and community development of the local area within which it is located. The clustering of major acute hospitals, together with

related clinical research and laboratory facilities on the campus, will not only generate significant additional direct and indirect employment but will also attract new health and knowledge-related industries to the area.

The Local Economic and Community Plan (LECP) is a statutory plan prepared under the Local Government Reform Act of 2014. The focus of the LECP is on the social and economic issues and goals that can be addressed by Dublin City Council along with local businesses, community and voluntary organisations and state bodies. The plan sets out high level goals, objectives and actions needed to promote and support economic and community development over its 6-year lifetime. 12 high level goals are set out, including the following which are considered to be of direct relevance to the proposal:

- To put in place the infrastructure that positions Dublin as a safe, environmentally sustainable, vibrant, diverse and attractive place to live, work, visit and invest in by planning and providing for balanced and sustainable social and economic development, catering for a growing population
- Provide and protect a range of public, safe and affordable amenities, activities and facilities that are relevant and accessible to people of all ages and abilities and that contribute to the health and well-being of all
- Promote access to a range of education, training and development opportunities starting in early childhood leading to a culture of lifelong learning and an appropriately qualified and skilled workforce
- Enhance the recognition of Dublin as a globally connected city region and as the national economic generator

The implementation of the LECP is a central element of the development plan's core strategy.

## 6.2 City-Wide Policy

In addition to the vision and the core strategy, the proposed development is supported by a number of city-wide policies set out in the Dublin City Development Plan. The following policies are of particular relevance:

**CC3** To promote energy efficiency, energy conservation, and the increased use of renewable energy in existing and new developments.

**CC4** To encourage building layout and design which maximises daylight, natural ventilation, active transport and public transport use

**SC13** To promote sustainable densities, particularly in public transport corridors, which will enhance the urban form and spatial structure of the city; which are appropriate to their context, and which are supported by a full range of community infrastructure such as schools, shops and recreational areas, having regard to the safeguarding criteria set out in Chapter 16 (development standards), including the criteria and standards for good neighbourhoods, quality urban design and excellence in architecture. These sustainable densities will include due consideration for the protection of surrounding residents, households and communities.

**SC16** To recognise that Dublin City is fundamentally a low-rise city and that the intrinsic quality associated with this feature is protected whilst also recognising the potential and need for taller buildings in a limited number of locations subject to the

provisions of a relevant LAP, SDZ or within the designated strategic development regeneration area (SDRA).

**SC19** To promote the development of a network of active, attractive and safe streets and public spaces which are memorable, and include, where appropriate, seating, and which encourage walking as the preferred means of movement between buildings and activities in the city. In the case of pedestrian movement with major developments, the creation of a public street is preferable to an enclosed arcade or other passageway.

**SC25** To promote development which incorporates exemplary standards of highquality, sustainable and inclusive urban design, urban form and architecture befitting the city's environment and heritage and its diverse range of locally distinctive neighbourhoods, such that they positively contribute to the city's built and natural environments. This relates to the design quality of general development across the city, with the aim of achieving excellence in the ordinary, and which includes the creation of new landmarks and public spaces where appropriate.

**CEE1**(i) To promote and enhance the role of Dublin as the national economic engine and driver of economic recovery and growth, with the city centre as its core economic generator. (ii) To promote and enhance the city's competitiveness and to address deficits, to improve the business environment so that existing jobs are supported and employment generated, and to be creative and practical in its responses to current economic challenges and opportunities.

**CEE2** To recognise the crucial need for the planning and sustainable development system to be agile and responsive in the face of challenging and rapidly changing circumstances. Dublin City Council will promote sustainable development by balancing complex sets of economic, environmental or social goals in planning decisions.

**CEE3** To take a positive and pro-active approach when considering the economic impact of major planning applications in order to support economic development, enterprise and employment growth and also to deliver high-quality outcomes.

**CEE20** To recognise that hospitals and the wider healthcare sector are crucial to the wellbeing of the city, including as major sources of employment, economic development and innovation; and to promote and facilitate their development and expansion.

**CEE21** i) To recognise the strategic role of the hospital complexes in the city including the proposed National Paediatric Hospital and the proposed new National Maternity Hospital and to support the provision of the appropriate volume of floor space and associated facilities necessary to secure the delivery of their services and potential; having regard to their national medical function, their role as a major employer in the city, as a generator of significant economic benefits for the economy of Dublin's inner city and a promoter of the knowledge economy through research and education links with third-level colleges in the city.(ii) To promote and facilitate the continued development of the Dublin 8 area as medical hub of excellence.(iii) To capitalise on the opportunities presented by the major public investment in healthcare facilities on the St James's Hospital campus, including the National Paediatric Hospital, by promoting the wider catchment area as a suitable location for new development, which will either directly support such new facilities (such as by

improving public realm in the vicinity and by encouraging the provision of housing for hospital staff); or which will benefit from locational synergy with the hospitals, such as new enterprises in the bio and life sciences, healthcare and related ICT and medical supplies sectors. (iv) To recognise the significant economic and employment benefits of the clustering of similar enterprises in an area (v) To promote and facilitate the development of various clusters or hubs in the city such food, creative industries, craft enterprises, green business etc. (vi) To promote and facilitate Dublin City as a hub for social enterprise in order to help address some of the critical needs within the city

*MT1* To support the sustainability principles set out in the following documents:

• The National Spatial Strategy/National Planning Framework

• The National Transport Authority's Transport Strategy for the Greater Dublin Area

- Smarter Travel, A Sustainable Transport Future 2009-2020.
- Regional Planning Guidelines for the Greater Dublin Area
- Design Manual for Urban Roads and Streets (DMURS)
- National Cycling Policy Framework and national Cycle Manual

Also, to ensure that land-uses and zoning are fully integrated with the provision of a high-quality transportation network that accommodates the movement needs of Dublin city and the region.

**MT11** To continue to promote improved permeability for both cyclists and pedestrians in existing urban areas in line with the National Transport Authority's document " Permeability – a best practice guide". Also, to carry out a permeability and accessibility study of appropriate areas in the vicinity of all Luas , Rail and BRT routes and stations, in cooperation with Transport Infrastructure Ireland and the National Transport Authority

*MT14* To minimise loss of on-street car parking, whilst recognizing that some loss of spaces is required for, or in relation to sustainable transport provision, access to new developments, or public realm improvements.

*MT16* To control the supply and price of all parking in the city in order to achieve sustainable transportation policy objectives.

*GIO2* To apply principles of Green Infrastructure development to inform the development management process in terms of design and layout of new residential areas, business/industrial development and other significant projects

**SN22** To facilitate the provision of hospital, local and other healthcare facilities in accordance with the requirements of the relevant healthcare authorities and to facilitate the consolidation or enhancement of these facilities within the city as an important resource for the city, region and State.

**CHC4** To protect the special interest and character of all\_Dublin's Conservation Areas(11.1.5.4).\_Development within or affecting all conservation areas will contribute positively to the character and distinctiveness; and take opportunities to protect and enhance the character and appearance of the area and its setting, wherever possible.

**SN1** To promote good urban neighbourhoods throughout the city which are well designed, safe and suitable for a variety of age groups and tenures, which are robust, adaptable, well served by local facilities and public transport, and which contribute to the structure and identity of the city, consistent with standards set out in this Plan.

**SN7** To support and encourage the future growth of a wide range of public, social and community services essential to local community life, and to promote and seek to provide multi-use, fit-for-purpose community facilities which are suitable for all ages and all abilities, are operated according to an effective and efficient management strategy, and which are accessible in terms of physical design, location, cost of use, and opening hours.

**SN16** To ensure that the provision of strategic new community infrastructure complements the range of existing neighbourhood facilities and, where appropriate, is located at the interface between communities to facilitate access across a number of neighbourhood areas and greater integration between communities and to support the provision of community facilities which act as point of integration between residents of new and established communities within neighbourhoods.

**SN22** To facilitate the provision of hospital, local and other healthcare facilities in accordance with the requirements of the relevant healthcare authorities and to facilitate the consolidation or enhancement of these facilities within the city as an important resource for the city, region and State.

**SN30** To promote sustainable neighbourhoods which cater to the needs of persons in all stages of their lifecycle i.e. children, people of working age, elderly, people with disabilities.

At a city wide contextual level it is considered that the proposal to provide a new maternity hospital aids the consolidation and enhancement of the existing facilities at St. Vincent's University Hospital Campus, and it will act as a key anchor in the attraction of additional activities to further stimulate growth and critical mass. Its development, along a key public transport infrastructure is further considered to support the Development Plan's vision and core strategy.

# 6.3 SITE SPECIFIC ZONING POLICY AND DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS

## 6.3.1 St. Vincent's University Hospital

The lands at St. Vincent's University Hospital campus are zoned as 'Institutional and Community Z15' under the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022 with a stated objective '*To protect and provide for institutional and community uses*'. The primary aim for these lands is to provide for institutional, educational, recreational, community, green infrastructure, and health uses. Buildings for the health, safety, or welfare of the public are permitted uses. Hence, the proposed National Maternity Hospital is considered a permissible use in the context of the Development Plan zoning.

The land immediately to the south of the hospital campus is zoned Z9 reflecting its role as a golf course, with an *objective 'to preserve, provide and improve recreational amenity and open space and green networks'*, land to the north-west (Merrion Centre) is zoned Z4 with an objective '*to provide for and improve mixed-services facilities*', while lands to the north, east and west are zoned for residential and

residential conservation use (Z1 and Z2) with objectives 'to protect, provide and improve residential amenities' and 'to protect and/or improve the amenities of residential conservation areas' respectively. Merrion Village apartment scheme (Z1), Ailesbury Park (Z2), small scale retail and petrol station, Our Lady Queen of Peace church & associated surface car parking (Z1) are all located directly to the north on the opposite side of Merrion Road. Herbert Avenue, zoned Z1 (residential) and Z2 (residential conservation) directly abuts the campus lands to the east. This is a small cul-de-sac of two-storey residential dwellings, a small-scale apartment block and commercial development (car sales) at its junction with Merrion Road.

The Z2 zoning (residential conservation) requires that special care is given in dealing with development proposals which may affect the special character of the conservation areas. Policy CHC4 applies.

Policy CH4: It is the policy of Dublin City Council to protect the special interest and character of all Dublin's Conservation areas. Development within or affecting all conservation areas will contribute positively to the character and distinctiveness; and take opportunities to protect and enhance the character and appearance of the area and its setting, wherever possible.

There are no protected structures on site nor is the site located within a site or zone of archaeological interest.

St. Vincent's University Hospital is an established adult hospital of long standing. The provision of the National Maternity Hospital on the same campus as the adult hospital will help reinforce the position St. Vincent's University Hospital as a centre of excellence in the area of health care, providing an integrated range of medical services for the Greater Dublin Region and beyond and achieving best practice in terms of colocation of medical specialisms.

The City Development Plan recognises that lands such as the St. Vincent's University Hospital campus are an important resource for the city and play an important role in achieving a more compact sustainable city in that they contribute to the creation of a vibrant neighbourhood and a sustainable well-connected city through the provision of such infrastructure as schools, hospitals and open space. In addition St. Vincent's University Hospital is a nationally important institution and it is stated City Council policy to cooperate with these institutions in order to promote the strategic long-term needs of the city and country. The plan specifically recognises the importance of providing a national maternity hospital in the city and has set policy to support the provision of the appropriate volume of floorspace to secure its delivery having regard to their national medical function, its role as a major employer in the city.

The plan continues that in the event of any development being proposed on institutional lands consideration should be given to their potential to contribute to the development of a strategic green network. The proposed development proposes to upgrade a number of existing access routes into the hospital campus to improve permeability. The creation of a new additional access route and entrance to the multi-storey car parking block off Merrion Road is well-considered and will facilitate the amenity of the new main entrance plaza, by removing through traffic running across the main SVUH campus spine road. Dedicated areas for set-down, emergency vehicles, disabled parking etc. are provided in the vicinity of the entrance area along the spine road.

In addition, the provision of a new cycle lane to run adjacent to the existing 'boulevard' north-south public pedestrian route will also facilitate improved access to the hospital campus, linking the intersection of Merrion Road, Nutley Lane and Merrion Shopping Centre to the north with the new main entrance plaza within the hospital campus to the south. In addition a new pedestrian access from the public car park and new bicycle parking areas are provided nearby.

While the city development plan requires that masterplans are prepared for larger developments proposed on institutional lands, it states no such masterplan is required for developments relating to extensions to the existing institutional use and enhancement of existing facilities. In this instance, since the proposal relates to an extension and enhancement of existing institutional uses on the site. No masterplan is, therefore, specifically required. However, the applicant has carried out a comprehensive Site Capacity Study and has submitted same with the application. This study has been prepared to test the capacity of the campus to accommodate future development, including provision for a 20% expansion of adult and maternity services. The study describes the proposed phasing of developments across the entire hospital campus in a planned manner, and intends to demonstrate that current proposals will not compromise or jeopardise any of these planned future developments. It is noted that this study is indicative only: it does not purport to be a development plan, but rather an indication of its potential capacity.

The development plan also requires that proposed developments at the perimeter of Z15 lands adjacent to existing residential development shall have regard to the prevailing height of existing residential development and to standards in section 16.0 in relation to aspect, natural lighting, sunlight, layout and private open space, and in section 14.7 in relation to the avoidance of abrupt transitions of scale between zoning. This is considered in detail below.

#### 6.4 Development Standards

#### 6.4.1 Plot Ratio and Site Coverage

The Dublin City Development Plan 2016 - 2022 sits within a hierarchy of plans, all of which seek to secure the consolidation and intensification of the city, while enhancing the quality of life and experience of the city for residents, workers, commuters and visitors. However, in order to prevent the adverse effects of overdevelopment, the Development Plan sets out recommended indicative standards for plot ratio and site coverage. The purpose of these tools is to control the mass and bulk of buildings and thereby protect residential amenities and minimise visual impact.

The development plan provides indicative plot ratio standards for Z15 (Institutional Long term) lands having an indicative plot ratio of 0.5 - 2.5 with the plan noting that a higher plot ratio may be permitted in certain circumstances such as: "To facilitate the strategic role of institutions such as hospitals".

A plot ratio of 1.59 is proposed. This is within the indicative plot ratio set down in the development plan.

The total site coverage of the existing buildings on the hospital campus is approximately 36%. The proposed site coverage is 39% which is less than the indicative maximum of 50%.

Therefore, it can be concluded that the proposed development is in compliance with these specific standards of the Development Plan. However, it is important that these standards are used in conjunction with other development control measures including building height, the provision of public and private open space including the development of a new public realm.

## 6.4.2 Height

The Dublin City Development Plan acknowledges the intrinsic quality of Dublin as a low-rise city and considers that it should predominantly remain so. The spatial approach to taller buildings in the city is in essence to protect the vast majority of the city as a low rise city, including established residential areas, while also recognising the potential and the need for taller buildings to deliver the core strategy.

The site of the proposed development is located within the Low Rise (rail hub i.e. within 500m of an existing DART station), being located within 500m of the DART mainline stop at Sydney Parade. Hence, the site is designated for low-rise development as defined in the Development Plan Development Standards Section (Chapter 16). These standards are tools for the assessment of proposals in the round, having regard to the core strategy to consolidate the city and support national institutions in the capital city.

Under current plan policy commercial buildings up to 24m in height are permissible in this area subject to compliance with all other development plan provisions. Height is presented in metres rather than storeys to take account of different floor-to-ceiling heights applicable to different uses of buildings. It should be noted that plant, flues, and lift overruns are not included in the height of a building as long as they are set back and properly screened and do not add the shadowing or otherwise of natural light beyond that of the main structure.

At its highest point the proposed hospital will rise to a maximum overall height of approximately 35m to top of stair core from a selected ground level of +6m ODM (\*41m ODM to top of lift shaft plant room and 47.3m ODM to top of boiler flues). The proposed height of the hospital building is, therefore, above the maximum building height permitted as set out in table in Section 16.7.2 of the development plan.

However it is explicitly stated in the development plan that there may be instances where greater height will be considered – see Section 16.7.2 - i.e. in areas where there is a pre-existing height on a site in a low rise area. In such areas a building of the same number of storeys may be permitted subject to an assessment against the standards set out elsewhere in the development plan and the submission of an Urban Design Statement outlining:

- The context with a site and area analysis which includes an appraisal of the character of the area adjoining the site
- The design principles which has been applied and how these will be translated to the development in terms of response to local character, layout, density, scale, landscape, visual appearance and impact on amenities, including sunlight
- Drawings, perspective and photo-montages to demonstrate how the approach has been applied

In addition all proposed for mid-rise buildings must also have regard to the assessment for high buildings as set out in Section 16.7.2 of the plan.

On this subject site there exists a pre-existing height over the maximum heights stipulated in the current development plan, namely the five-storey plus plant Clinical Services building (+35.94ODM), the seven-storey plus plant Nutley Wing (+40.165 ODM) and the eight-storey plus plant private hospital building (+45.15ODM).

In support of the proposal the applicant has submitted an Urban Design Report which outlines in detail the site and its context including an appraisal of the area adjoining the site. In this regard the variation in topography levels are noted with the site sloping from south to north with the ground levels falling from approximately +10.00m Ordnance Datum along the south and falling to approximately +04.0m Ordnance Datum at the north close to Merrion Road. The ground levels in the area proposed for the new Maternity Hospital are described as changing across the site and found to have significant influence on setting out the optimum floor level strategy for the new building. This sloping nature of the site has also impacted upon the setting of levels in the SVUH Clinical Services Block which has an entrance 800mm lower than level 0 in the rest of the SVUH hospital.

The design approach to the layout and architectural form of the different elements of the building has been carefully considered and has had regard to both the relevant development plan policy and to the local physical context as outlined in further detail in this report. In addition it should be noted that the application has also been assessed by the Architects Division of DCC who consider that the scale and form of the hospital is respectful to its existing context, concluding that the application appears well-considered and deem that there are no major issues with the development as proposed.

The principal building, the national maternity hospital, comprises of an integrated, modern, fit-for-purpose maternity hospital that will provide an appropriate environment for mothers and children in its care. The hospital will also be able to provide enough space and facilities to function to the highest level while at the same time respecting its suburban context in close proximity to low-rise residential development.

The proposed hospital is within 500m of a Dart line, a major transport corridor, along which higher density developments are appropriate in the context of supporting a consolidated, sustainable city in line with national, regional and local policy. The new maternity hospital represents a medical facility of strategic importance and its location on an existing hospital campus linking in with existing medical specialisms is in line with city policy to facilitate the development of economic specialisms and drivers of the economy.

The planning authority considers that the height and design of the hospital building have been carefully considered with its design allowing for direct integration with the existing clinical services building with which it shall link internally. Such links, as the applicant explained in detail, are essential to the efficient functioning of the new building and the height as proposed is an element that is required to allow for this. The planning authority considers that the proposed height, form and massing of the new hospital building are acceptable from a visual perspective, relating well with the prevailing height and context in the immediate area.

#### 6.4.3 Impacts on Residential Amenity

It is considered that the design of the proposal has carefully considered its context adjoining residential development, including two-storey residential development in a conservation area (Z2) abutting the site. The design report details the design process of the proposal in order to break down the scale of the eastern elevation having regard to the proximity of local residences along Herbert Avenue. Since Herbert Avenue is set at an angle to the proposal the southern part of the eastern elevation of the hospital has been stepped back with additional setbacks and roof terraces at levels 02-06 and levels 04-05 respectively. The stepping back of the building from residential development along Herbert Avenue allows for the impact on these residences to be significantly reduced and within acceptable parameters. Furthermore, the EIS focuses on the impact of the proposal on Herbert Avenue and details that the preferred design was ultimately chosen based on having the least impact on the surrounding environment, particularly on Herbert Avenue.

Overlooking is a potential concern, particularly from the east elevation of the hospital, into the rear of properties along Herbert Avenue. In this regard it is noted that separation distances of between 47m and 63m have been provided for between the new hospital building and the closest six houses along Herbert Avenue. These separation distances are considered adequate in the protection of residential amenities currently enjoyed by residents of the properties. Furthermore in order to avoid undue overlooking from external terraces opaque glazing is being utilised. In addition, windows have been designed to direct views away from residences along this avenue.

The north elevation i.e. that elevation facing, and most visible from, Merrion Road and Nutley Lane was also subject to various refinements in the design process. The resulting design has been the introduction of an open space at first floor level over the entrance of the hospital and the resultant 'thinning out' of the mass of this portion of the building. It should also be noted that the new hospital building is set back by between 58 metres to 85 metres at the main entrance to over 140 metres at the western end of the façade.

## 6.4.4 Visual Impact

Having regard to the large floor area and the height of the proposed hospital it is anticipated that the proposed development will have a visual impact in the locality. The issue is whether the proposal will negatively impact on the visual amenities of the area.

The Planning Authority acknowledges that a significant emphasis has been placed on the design of the proposed main hospital building and the breaking down of the mass of the building where it is located in close proximity to residential areas and as viewed from the main roads, Merrion Road and Nutley Lane. It is accepted that the design response is successful in breaking down the scale of the building, particularly along its eastern and northern edges close to residential and visually prominent areas.

The application has also been assessed by the Architects Division of DCC who considers that the scale and form of the hospital is respectful to its existing context particularly to St. Vincent's University Hospital (SVUH) adjacent. The proposed National Maternity Hospital building makes reference to the scale, form, materials and alignment of SVUH adjacent. The solid to void ratios of glazing and the pattern of fenestration are considered appropriate to the scale of the building and assist in animating the building facades. The oblique reveals to some of the windows,

proposed screens, and vertical fin articulations also add further interest to the building and assist in breaking down the mass of the building.

It is considered that the proposed granite facades are respectful to Dublin's tradition of building civic buildings from stone, and will further connect the proposed National Maternity Hospital building to the recently constructed buildings of St. Vincent's University Hospital, Breast Check, the Nutley Wing and St. Vincent's Private Hospital which are all clad in granite.

As noted in the application, there are a number of existing large developments along the Merrion Road, many with a campus type character, which assist in integrating the proposed development into the area. Due to its distance and setbacks from the adjoining roads and properties, particularly at Herbert Avenue, the proposed heights are considered appropriate, and are not deemed to be detrimental to the amenity of the surrounding area. The taller block proposed to the east of the National Maternity Hospital successfully bookends the development addressing Merrion Road.

A number of planted atria, courtyards, and balconies are proposed throughout the scheme which improves the visual amenity of the building. It is noted that a number of roofs in the new National Maternity Hospital building contain green sedum type roofs/planting, while others do not contain any such greening proposals. However this may be due to the fact that some of the roofspace is to accommodate plant and cannot therefore be subjected to 'greening'.

#### Local, Middle and Long Distance Views

An analysis of the likely impacts of the proposed development on the surrounding environment has been undertaken and included with the application including photomontages (Vol 2.14 of the EIS and Vol 4 Photomontages refer), have been submitted with the application.

21 no. locations were identified where further analysis of visibility and potential impact would be assisted by the preparation of photomontages i.e. Views A to U. The planning authority agrees with the applicant that these are the most sensitive visual reference points.

The extent of potential and predicted visual impacts on the built environment have been defined with reference to the list of views ranging from (i) Imperceptible Impact; (ii) Slight Impact, (iii) Moderate Impact; (iv) Significant Impact (iv) Profound Impact. There impact definitions are taken from Section 5: Glossary of Impacts contained in the 'Guidelines on the Information to be contained in EIAs' (EPA 2002).

View	View Location – View From	Potential Impact	
А	Merrion Road at Ailesbury Park	Moderate	
В	Merrion Road at the entrance to Hospital	Moderate	
	Campus		
С	Merrion Road just east of Herbert Avenue	Slight to Moderate	
D	Merrion Road at Merrion Gates	Imperceptible	
E	Merrion Road south east of Merrion Gates	None to Slight	
F	Near centre of Herbert Ave looking West	Moderate	
G	Near centre of Herbert Ave looking North	Imperceptible to Moderate	
Н	Entrance to Private Hospital	Moderate	

The potential visual impact from each of the 21 locations is tabulated below:

	Entrance to Herbert Wing	Moderate
J	Outside Clinical Services Building	Moderate
K	Vehicular Access to A & E Department	Moderate
L	Pedestrian Lights on Nutley Lane	Moderate
М	Nutley Ave at the entrance to St. Michael's	Slight to Moderate
	College	
Ν	Sydney Parade Dart Station	None
0	Elm Park Golf Club	Imperceptible to Slight
Р	Bellview Park, looking into Elm Park Golf	None
	Club	
Q	UCD Campus, just south of Belfield House	None
R	Mount Anville Road	Imperceptible to Slight
S	Poolbeg	Imperceptible
Т	West Pier Dun Laoghaire	None to Imperceptible
U	Howth	Imperceptible

The planning authority considered the results of the visual impact acceptable and welcomes the findings that no potential view will be significant or profound and notes that there are no developments proposed within the zone of visual influence that will have the potential to result in material cumulative impacts.

## 6.4.5. Daylight, Sunlight and Overshadowing

The Planning Authority has reviewed the detailed assessment submitted by the applicant and the specific representative reference points where detailed calculations analysis of Daylight, Sunlight and Overshadowing were carried out. The report assesses the impact of the development to the nearest dwellings to the proposed development i.e. those located to the east along Herbert Avenue, to the north east on Merrion Road and to the north west on Nutley Lane. The planning authority agrees with the applicant that these are the most sensitive reference points. Loss of daylight and sunlight has been considered to the vindows at Herbert Avenue, Merrion Road and Nutley Lane with overshadowing to the rear of gardens of Herbert Avenue also considered. For dwellings in Nutley Lane and Merrion Road the rear gardens would be unaffected by the proposed development.

Based on the submitted results, it concurs that given the nature of the proposed development and its overall size, the impacts on daylight, sunlight and overshadowing are small or negligible and within the BRE guidelines, and would mostly be considered not significant. It also acknowledges that the final form, massing and setting back of the hospital building has played a part in reducing potential negative impacts on properties in the vicinity of the site.

## 6.4.6 Microclimate and Wind

The Planning Authority has reviewed the detailed assessment submitted by the applicant and the findings of the likely significant effects on the local wind microclimate as a result of the construction of the proposed hospital.

The Planning Authority notes the findings of the studies and that with proposed mitigation in place a microclimate will be created that is typically calmer of the same as for the baseline conditions. In the event of the Board granting planning permission, it requests that the applicant be required to carry out the necessary mitigation measures as proposed including the provision of landscaping.

It also requests that conditions be included requiring that monitoring particularly of landscape implementation and establishment be required to ensure that such measures as necessary are provided and maintained.

## Extension to Car Park

The proposal includes an expansion of the existing multi-storey car park in order to accommodate the additional parking demand associated with the NMH. Landscaping proposals have been extended around the car park to include trees concentrated along the northern and western elevations to screen views of the car park from Nutley Lane and adjacent residential areas. Proposals to green the carpark building with climbing plants, hedges and trees are welcome and will assist in softening the appearance of this building addressing Nutley Lane and its intersection with Merrion Road. In addition, at the southern end of the car park the applicant has proposed a stainless steel wire trellis system to the full height of the car park to screen this elevation from the hospital entrance along Nutley Lane. The planning authority has no objection to the expansion of the car park, recognising the necessity for same. However, given its location in such close proximity to adjoining public roads, and its visibility in the area it is considered appropriate that adequate screening measures be applied in order to improve its appearance as viewed from both within the campus and from the public domain. In this regard it is recommended that that this trellis and planting screen should be provided on all sides of the carpark to completely merge the carpark building into the landscape.

A stainless steel wire trellis and planting screen is proposed to run along the southern face of the carpark. It is, however, considered that this trellis and planting screen should be provided on all sides of the carpark to completely merge the carpark building into the landscape.

## **DRAINAGE DIVISION – Report received stating:**

There is No Objection to this proposal, subject to all drainage elements being constructed in accordance with both the Engineer's Report and Flood Risk Assessment Report compiled by Arups and submitted with this planning application.

All drainage must be designed and constructed on the Completely Separate System with Stormwater being attenuated and Sustainable Drainage Systems (Suds) being utilised.

#### 6.5 MOVEMENT AND TRANSPORT

The Roads and Traffic Planning Division (RTPD) of Dublin City Council have carried out an assessment of the application including the EIS, the various aspects of the construction and operational phases of the development which have the potential to impact on roads, traffic and transportation and the magnitude of these impacts, mitigation measures and the residual impact post mitigation measures.

Detailed comments on the application and recommended conditions if permission is granted are set out below.

Environmental Impact Assessment

The Roads and Traffic Planning Division is satisfied with the 'substance' of information submitted as part of the EIS.

#### Proposed Junction Improvements

The proposed development comprises of modifications to the existing road junctions at Nutley Lane and Merrion Road.

The Proposed Site Layout Plan (Drawing no. NCH\_OCM\_A\_DR\_PA\_011) submitted in conjunction with the application illustrates indicative works both Merrion Road and Nutley Lane subject to the agreement of DCC.

The proposed Merrion Road Junction Improvements are illustrated on Drawing no. NMH\_ARU\_T\_DR\_PA\_002 prepared by ARUP Consulting Engineers illustrates the specific details of improvements proposed to Merrion Road. These works are located outside of the planning application boundary and include the following:

- Existing signal controlled entrance to be modified;
- Left turn slip lane and island to be removed;
- Pedestrian crossings and signals to be relocated;

The proposed junction improvements to Nutley Lane are illustrated on Drawing no. NMH\_ARU\_T\_DR\_PA\_001. These works include the following:

- Removal of the existing 8 no. on street car parking spaces along Nutley Lane;
- Existing carriageway to be remarked to provide a dedicated right turn lane
- Existing signal controlled entrance to be modified to allow for longer right turn egress lane

The RTPD recommend that prior to the commencement of development the applicant liaise with the Environment and Transportation Department in respect of the proposed works to Merrion Road and Nutley Lane and that any revisions to the adjoining road network including provision of right turning lanes and removal of onstreet car parking where necessary shall be agreed with the Environment and Transportation Department prior to the commencement of development

#### Car Parking

A summary of the existing and proposed car parking provision is set out within Section 6.4.7 of the Traffic and Transportation Chapter of the EIS. This outlines that existing car parking available to the campus comprises parking within the campus, external on street parking spaces and external private car parks.

Table 6.4 of the Traffic and Transportation Study outlines that there are approximately 1,012 car parking spaces on the campus associated with the existing hospital and a further 306 spaces associated with St. Vincent's Private Hospital (278 no.), the mortuary (22no.) and ambulance bays (6no.).

Of the existing spaces 559 are staff spaces, 411 are visitor spaces and 42 are disabled spaces. In addition to the campus spaces, approximately 70 spaces are rented by St Vincent's University Hospital from Old Belvedere Rugby Club.

In addition pay and display parking is provided along Nutley Lane and Merrion Road and their associated side streets including Nutley Road, Elm Park, Nutley Avenue, Merrion Avenue, Sydney Parade Avenue, Ailesbury Park, Herbert Avenue and Estate Avenue.

It is stated in the EIS that the existing car parks within the Campus are actively managed. The peak car parking demand is identified between 10.00 and 15.00.

The application site is located within Parking Area 2 as identified within Map J of the Dublin City Development Plan. Table 16.1 of the City Development Plan identifies a maximum parking standard of 1 space per 100sq.m. gfa of hospital floorspace in parking area 2. On this basis a maximum of 508 no. spaces could be provided to serve the proposed hospital.

An additional 277 car parking spaces are proposed as part of the subject application. This additional parking is accommodated through the vertical and horizontal expansion of the existing multi storey car park. The RTPD consider this quantum of additional parking acceptable. It is acknowledged that there is an overall quantum of car parking available on campus. It is further considered that Proactive Mobility Management shall ensure that adequate car parking spaces are available for visitor and shift workers.

#### Existing Traffic Patterns

Traffic counts on the surrounding road network were undertaken on the 15<sup>th</sup> of October 2014. Further surveys were undertaken on the 18<sup>th</sup> of January 2017. The scope of the traffic surveys was agreed in advance with this division. These counts established current traffic conditions and existing distribution of trips on the local road network.

The traffic counts show that the surrounding road network is busy with congestion and queuing experienced during peak periods. The am peak on the local road network is identified between 07.45 and 08.45 and the pm peak is identified between 17.45 and 18.45. The Stillorgan Road is identified as the busiest link on the surrounding road network during the am and pm peak with over 3,800 no. vehicles recorded between 07.45 and 08.45 and 4,000 no. vehicles recorded during the pm peak. Merrion Road also experiences high traffic flows during the am and pm peak.

The morning and evening peaks for the hospital campus differ from those on the local road network. The campus am peak is identified between 07.00 and 08.00 and the pm peak is between 16.00 and 17.00, a further mid-day peak is identified between 14.00 and 15.00. A summary of the traffic counts on the local road network are summarised in Table 6.3 of the EIS.

In this regard it is stated that vehicular trips associated with St. Vincent's Hospital only correspond to a small part of the traffic on the local road network.

#### Traffic Impact

Section 6.6.3.1 of the Traffic Assessment assesses the projected number of vehicles that will be generated by the new National Maternity Hospital on the basis of the provision of an additional 277 car parking spaces for staff, patients and visitors and the implementation of the Mobility Management Strategy.

Table 6.10 sets out the following trip generation at the Campus peak hours.

## Table 6.10: Traffic Generation Campus Peak

	Campus AM Peak		Campus PM Peak	
	Entry	Exit	Entry	Exit
Existing no. of trips	686	176	173	544
Rate per space	0.54	0.14	0.14	0.43
Estimated NMH Trips	148	38	37	118

Table 6.11 sets out the following traffic generation levels as a result of the proposed development on the local road network.

## Table 6.11: Traffic Generation Road Network Peak

	Campus AM Peak		Campus PM Peak	
	Entry	Exit	Entry	Exit
Existing no. of trips	465	239	173	270
Rate per space	0.36	0.19	0.13	0.21
Estimated NMH Trips	100	52	37	58

The TTA outlines that there is a higher level of two-way trips associated with the proposed NMH during the Campus AM and PM peak periods. It is stated that these trips occur when the volume of traffic on the surrounding road network is lower.

Traffic generated by the proposed development is distributed to the local road network based on the current distribution of traffic associated with the existing hospital campus. The assignment of traffic between the two Campus entrances at Merrion Road and Stillorgan Road is summarised below:

## Nutley Lane Entrance

- AM peak 66-69% of traffic enters and exits via the Nutley Lane entrance
- PM peak 55-65% of traffic enters and exits via the Nutley Lane entrance

## Merrion Road Entrance

- AM peak 34%-31% of traffic enters and exits via the Merrion Road entrance
- PM peak 35%-45% of traffic enters and exits via the Merrion Road entrance

The projected increase in traffic generated by the development during the Campus peak is less than 3.5% on all links apart from a section of Nutley Lane (between the R138 and the Campus Entrance) where the increase is a maximum of 9.1% during the morning period and 6.9% during the evening period.

Likewise the impact of the projected traffic flows during the local road network peaks is less than 2.5% on all roads apart from a section of Nutley Lane (between the R138 Stillorgan Road and the Campus entrance) where the increase is a maximum of 5.5% during the morning peak hour and 4.8% during the evening peak hour.

The traffic impact assessment concludes that the proposed NMH will have a "not significant to slight impact" on the adjoining road network during both the Campus peak hours and the road network peak hours.

A junction analysis is presented in Table 6.16 of the traffic assessment. The following junctions are analysed in this regard:

- R138 Stillorgan Road/Nutley Lane 1.9% increased during am peak and 1.1% during pm peak
- Merrion Road/Ailesbury Road 1.8% increase during am peak and 1.3% increase during pm peak
- Merrion Road/Nutley Lane 2% increase during am peak and 1.4% increase during pm peak
- Merrion Road/Strand Road 1.2% increase during am peak and 0.9% impact during pm peak
- Merrion Road/Campus Entrance 3.4% increase during am peak and 2.4% increase during pm peak
- Nutley Lane/ Campus Entrance 6.8% impact during am peak and 6.3% impact during pm peak.

A number of junctions on the surrounding road network have been analysed using the junction analysis software LinSig. A capacity analysis is undertaken of the following junctions within the EIS:

- R138 Stillorgan Road/Nutley Lane;
- R118 Merrion Road/Nutley Lane;
- R118 Merrion Road/Campus Entrance;
- Nutley Lane/Campus Entrance;

These junctions were considered either because of the levels of traffic increases as a result of the new development or in light of their performance in the local road network. Tables 6.17 to 6.20 of the EIS identifies limited increase in traffic during the am and pm Campus peak as a result of the proposed development. The proposed impact on the various junctions is identified as being imperceptible to slight on the various junctions.

The TIA refers to improvements to the entrance to the campus from Merrion Road and Nutley Lane which would result in more efficient traffic movements. Any works to the public road including removal/relocation of car parking and provision of right turning lanes as may be required by DCC shall be carried out at the applicant's expense at no cost to Dublin City Council and to the detailed requirements of the Environment and Transportation Department.

#### Mobility Management

Section 6.5 of the EIS identifies mobility management measure looks to build upon and enhance the measures and initiatives already in place on Campus.

Detailed measures to promote walking, cycle and use of public transport to the Campus are identified within the Mobility Management Plan. The continued active promotion of mobility management measures is welcomed.

#### Cycle parking

Within the hospital campus cycle lanes are provided along the main internal streets.

Cycle parking standards are set out within Table 16.2 of the City Development Plan. This sets out a requirement for 1 space per 5 beds for hospital developments in Area

2. The proposed Maternity Hospital comprises 244 no. beds. On this basis there is a requirement for 49 no. cycle parking spaces. 270 no. additional cycle parking spaces are proposed within the subject application. This level of cycle parking provision is welcomed.

The proposed additional cycle parking spaces are proposed within two new single storey bicycle store enclosures (170 sq.m. and 158 sq.m.) located to the south of the existing Nurse Education Centre.

#### Cycle Route

The Rock Road/Merrion Road corridor is identified as a Primary Cycle Route within the GDA Cycle Network Plan. The NTA have recently published for consultation the Sandymount/Merrion to Blackrock Corridor Study which seeks to provide a high quality cycle route between Sandymount and Blackrock. Nutley Lane is also identified as a Secondary Cycle Route within the GDA Cycle Network Plan.

The applicant engaged with the NTA prior to the lodgement of the application. Correspondence from the NTA is attached as Appendix 1.2 of the Environmental Impact Statement. The correspondence from the NTA is dated the 29<sup>th</sup> of January 2016. The following points relate to the cycle facilities:

- The NTA correspondence outlines that a key objective of the emerging design for the Sandymount/Merrion to Blackrock Corridor Study will go to public consultation in the coming months.
- Nutley Lane forms an important link between UCD and the Sydney Parade Dart Station. The correspondence from the NTA confirms that initial designs for a two way cycle route along this route but further design and planning work is require before a final solution for this cycle link is selected.

It is noted that this correspondence is dated January 2016 in the interim period the NTA have published the draft corridor study for the Sandymount/Merrion to Blackrock Corridor Study. The NTA are currently reviewing submissions made during the initial consultation period.

It is noted that there are some differences in layout between the proposed development and the draft cycle layout. Notwithstanding, the proposed development does not preclude the delivery of the final layout design of the cycle route.

The RTPD report recommends that prior to the commencement of development the applicant shall liaise with the NTA in terms of the requirements for the road network adjoining the Hospital Campus including Merrion Road and Nutley Lane.

#### Public Transport

The hospital is well served in terms of linkages to public transport including the Dart Station at Sydney Parade and frequent bus services along Merrion Road.

#### Construction Management Plan

An initial Construction Management Plan is included in 6.6 of the Environmental Impact Statement. It is stated that during different stages of construction traffic will enter and egress the campus either via a proposed one-way construction route from Nutley Lane or from the Merrion Road entrance/exit.

Section 6.7.1 of the EIS refers to the preparation of a detailed Construction Traffic Management Plan on appointment of the main contractor for the development. Measures which will be included within the Plan include limited parking for construction staff, working hours outside of the road network peaks, construction of the multi storey car park in the initial stage of the projection, separation of construction traffic from general traffic associated with the Campus, management of construction vehicles on the public road and implementation of a Mobility Management Plan.

The RTPD recommend that prior to the commencement of development and on appointment of a contractor for the development the applicant shall submit a detailed Construction Management Plan for the written agreement.

## Conclusion of RTPD Comments

The division has no objection to the principle of the proposed development subject to conditions, including that i) a detailed Construction Management Plan, a Car Park Management Plan and details of all works, and signage, proposed on the public road be submitted for written agreement of the Environment and Transportation Department; ii) The implementation of measures in the Mobility Management Plan; and iii) liaison with the NTA for the provision of a cycle land along Merrion Road and Nutley Lane

#### 6.6 WASTE REGULATION

The proposed development has been assessed by the Waste Regulation Section of the Waste Management of Dublin City Council which has raised no objections to the proposal. Conditions are recommended and detailed below.

## 6.7 SUSTAINABLE BUILDING DESIGN

The applicant states all aspects of energy requirements of the NMH have been considered, looking at the site from a holistic viewpoint in order to propose an energy solution that considers the following elements:

- BREEAM bespoke application to achieve an 'excellent' target for the new build
- Energy and carbon targets
- Building Energy Rating A3 target

It is policy of the city council to promote energy efficiency, energy conservation, and the increased use of renewable energy in existing and new developments. The planning authority welcomes the applicant's building energy rating target of A3.

## 6.8 APPROPRIATE ASSESSMENT

The applicants have included a Screening Report & Natura Impact Statement with the application. This report includes information to allow the competent authority, in this case An Bord Pleanála, to carry out both a Stage One Screening for Appropriate Assessment and a Stage Two full Appropriate Assessment of required.

The report outlines the Natura 2000 sites within 15km of the development site proposed for development. The report concluded that it is not possible to exclude, on the basis of objective information, that the proposed development, individually or in combination with other plans or projects, will have a likely significant effects on the following four European sites:

- North Dublin Bay cSAC;
- South Dublin Bay cSAC
- South Dublin Bay and River Tolka Estuary SPA; and
- North Bull Island SPA.

The report identified potential construction-related surface water discharges from the various sits as having potential (in the absence of mitigation) for impacting on European Sites downstream. Specific mitigation measures have been proposed to address the potential for any adverse effects from the proposed development including a Construction Management Plan. However. The report concludes that there will be no adverse impact on the integrity of any of the four relevant sites with the full implementation of the mitigation measures outlined in the Natura Impact Statement.

## 7.0 CONCLUSION

The Planning Authority has assessed this application which is of major strategic importance under several headings and at different levels, balancing a complex set of economic, environmental and social goals. At the regional and national level, it is satisfied that the provision of the National Maternity Hospital and associated facilities on the St. Vincent's University Campus supports the Dublin City Development Plan's vision, core strategy, policies, objectives and development standards. It also considers that it is fully compliant with regional and national level policies that promote the intensification and consolidation of the Dublin City metropolitan area.

In assessing the proposal, the Planning Authority has given careful consideration to the local context and to the potential impact of the proposed development on residential and visual amenities. It considers that the form and layout of the building has been carefully designed to maximise sunlight into the public spaces, protect residential amenities and minimise overshadowing of the adjoining and surrounding residential areas. In particular, the Planning Authority is satisfied that the design, including the form and layout will ensure that the building will respect the character of the existing/established residential areas in the immediate vicinity of the site.

It is the opinion of the Planning Authority that the careful handling of the form of the hospital building and the meticulous way the massing of the building has been broken up has played a significant part in generating a suitable transition in scale between the proposed development and the adjoining residential areas. It also accepts that the form of the building helps to successfully mitigate the impact of the building, making it less imposing and reducing its perceived scale when viewed in the wider urban landscape. Critically, the architectural form of the building has also helped to avoid the potential negative impact of the development through undue overshadowing and overlooking of properties in the vicinity of the site and the loss of daylight and sunlight. The application has been considered by DCC's City Architects Division and a report prepared (full report attached in Appendix) concluding that "In general, the development appears to be well considered, and it is deemed that no major issues are perceived with the development as currently proposed".

On the matter of height, the Planning Authority notes that the maximum height of the proposal is above the maximum permissible under the current plan, it is considered acceptable in this instance having regard to:

- The context of the site and the surrounding area
- The application of well-considered design principles and the translation of these to the development in terms of response to local character, layout, density, scale, landscape, visual appearance and impact on amenities, including sunlight
- The strategic nature, identified need and importance of the proposal and the high quality design of same
- The specialised design parameters required for a hospital
- The regard had for, and protection, of amenities of nearby and adjacent residential and other development

It is the opinion of the Planning Authority that the proposed building complies with the Development Plan Standards for sites with a pre-existing height over those stipulated in the plan as expressed in Section 16.7.2 Pre-existing Height in Low-Rise Areas. However, it is noted by the Planning Authority if the Board is of the opinion that the overall height materially contravenes the Dublin City Development Plan, that Section 37G(6) of the Planning and Development Act, 2000 (as amended) states:

"The Board may decide to grant a permission for development, or any part of a development, under this section even if the proposed development, or part thereof, contravenes materially the development plan relating to any area in which it is proposed to situate the development."

It is the opinion of the Planning Authority that the careful handling of the form of the building and the careful way the massing of the building has been broken up has played a significant part in generating a suitable transition in scale between the proposed development and the adjoining residential areas.

Overall, the Planning Authority has concluded that the proposed development is compliant with national and regional planning policy, the policies, objectives and development standards of the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022 subject to compliance with relevant conditions, as attached. Therefore, as the proposal is considered to be in accordance with the proper planning and sustainable development of the area, the Planning Authority has no objection to the proposed development.

## **8.0 RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS**

## 8.1 Roads and Traffic

- 1) Prior to commencement of development and on appointment of the main contractor, the applicant shall submit for the written agreement of Environment and Transportation Department a detailed Construction Management Plan.
- 2) (a) The applicant shall undertake to implement the measures outlined in the Mobility Management Plan. The appointed Mobility Manager shall coordinate, implement, monitor and update the plan in consultation with the working group and steering group. The MMP shall be implemented to the requirements of the

Environment and Transportation Department, Dublin City Council and the National Transport Authority.

- (b) Prior to occupation of the development, the Mobility Manager shall liaise with Environment & Transportation Department regarding a strategy for promoting sustainable travel among staff particularly those relocating to St. Vincent's Hospital Campus.
- (c) Six months post occupation campus wide staff travel surveys shall be undertaken and the results submitted to Environment and Transportation Department.
- 3) Prior to the commencement of development, the applicant shall liaise with the NTA in terms of the requirements for the proposed cycle lane provision along Merrion Road and Nutley Lane.
- 4) Prior to commencement of development the applicant shall submit for the written agreement of Environment and Transportation Department a Car Park Management Plan. The Car Park Management Plan shall detail how car parking for the entire St. Vincent's Hospital Campus shall be managed through signage and other appropriate physical measures to ensure segregation of parking by user (staff/visitor). The applicant shall regularly monitor the use of car parks and in particular access by staff to visitor car parks. The manner and frequency of monitoring shall be to the requirements of Environment and Transportation Department.
- 5) Prior to the commencement of development all works proposed on the public road network, shall be subject to written agreement and approval from the Environment and Transportation Department. Any works to the public road including removal/relocation of car parking and provision of right turning lanes as may be required by DCC shall be carried out at the applicant's expense at no cost to Dublin City Council and to the detailed requirements of the Environment and Transportation Department. All materials should be agreed in detail with Dublin City Council and should be in accordance with the document Construction Standards for Roads and Street Works in Dublin City Council.
- 6) The location of signage proposed on public roads as part of any wayfinding strategy shall be agreed in writing with the Planning and Environment & Transportation Departments of Dublin City Council prior to the commencement of development.
- 7) All costs incurred by Dublin City Council, including any repairs to the public road and services necessary as a result of the development, shall be at the expense of the developer.
- 8) The developer shall be obliged to comply with the requirements set out in the Code of Practice.

## 8.2 Building Design and Landscaping

1. Full details of implementation, phasing and maintenance of landscaping shall be submitted to and agreed in writing with the Planning Authority prior to the commencement of development

2. Proposed signage for the building shall be agreed with the Planning Authority prior to the commencement of development

3. Full details of all screening measures for all proposed plant at roof level shall be submitted to the planning authority for written agreement prior to the commencement of any development on site.

4. Full details of screening measures and planting proposed for the outdoor terraces and gardens shall be submitted for the written agreement of the planning authority prior to the commencement of any development on site. These measures/devices are to ensure no undue overlooking of dwellings in Herbert Avenue.

5. Detailed plans for areas of public open space which are either in charge or be taken in charge by Dublin City Council shall be submitted for written agreement prior to commencement of development

6. The landscaping scheme accompanying the application shall be implemented fully in the first planting season following completion of the development, and any trees or shrubs which die or are removed within 3 years of planting shall be replaced in the first planting season thereafter

7. An indoor landscaping plan shall be submitted for approval prior to the commencement of development

8. The stainless steel wire trellis and planting screen as proposed for the southern face of the car park shall be provided on all sides of the existing car park and extensions to same. Full details of this screening shall be submitted to the planning authority for written agreement prior to the commencement of development.

Reason: In the interest of amenity, ecology, protection of residential amenities and sustainable development.

## 8.3 Waste Regulation

Construction and Demolition Projects

a. Prior to the commencement of any works, a Construction and Demolition Waste Management Plan must be furnished to and approved by Dublin City Council having regard to Circular WPR 07/06 - Best Practice Guidelines on the Preparation of Waste Management Plans for Construction and Demolition Projects - published by the DECLG, July 2006

b. In the event that hazardous soil, or historically deposited waste is encountered during the construction phase, the contractor must notify Dublin City Council and provide a Hazardous/Contaminated Soil Management Plan, to include estimated tonnages, description of location, any relevant mitigation, destination for disposal/treatment, in addition to information on the authorised waste collector(s).

- c. Prior to the commencement of any storage of waste on-site, the applicant must consult with the Waste Regulation Unit of Dublin City Council.
- d. Monthly reports regarding the management of the waste during works, must be forwarded electronically to the Waste Regulation Unit of Dublin City Council <u>waste.regulation@dublincity.ie</u>
- e. The works <u>must</u> comply with the following:
  - i) Waste Management Act 1996, as amended.

Dublin City Council Waste Bye-Laws 2013 (Bye-Laws for the storage, presentation and collection of Household and Commercial waste) or any revision thereof.

- ii) Eastern & Midlands Regional Waste Management Plan 2015-2021.
- iii) Best Practice Guidelines on the Preparation of Waste Management Plans for the Construction and Demolition Projects – DECLG 2006.
- iv) Waste Management (Hazardous Waste) (Amendment) Regulations S.I. No 73/2000
- v) National Hazardous Waste Management Plan 2014-2020
- vi) Article 27 of the European (Waste Directive) Regulations S.I. No 126 of 2011
- vii) Any other relevant Waste Management related regulations
- viii) Dublin City Development Plan (Current Version)

#### Waste (Standards for Commercial/Industrial Developments)

- a. The requirements set out in the Bye-Laws for the Storage, Presentation and Collection of Household and Commercial Waste, 2013 or any revision thereof must be adhered to and, in particular, the requirement to segregate waste into separate fractions to facilitate the collection of dry recyclables, organic kitchen/garden waste and residual waste in line with Waste Management (Food Waste) Regulations 2009 (S.I. 508/2009), and the Waste Management (Food Waste) Amendment Regulations S.I. 190 of 2015, and the Eastern -Midlands Region Waste Management Plan 2015-2021.
- b. The following are also requirements:
  - Receptacles that are designed for reuse, with the exception of in specific areas designated by a local authority as being only suitable for the collection of non-reusable receptacles such as bags, ideally of 1,100L capacity, must be used.
  - ii) Adequate storage space for a minimum of 1 No. 1,100 Litre receptacle.
  - iii) Sufficient space must be provided to accommodate the separate collection of dry recyclables and organic food/garden waste.
  - iv) Adequate space and height for a standard Refuse Collection Vehicle (RCV) to access site.
  - v) Sufficient access and egress must be provided to enable receptacles to be moved easily from the storage area to an appropriate collection point on the public street nearby.
  - vi) Receptacle storage areas must not be visible from or on a public street.
  - vii) The receptacle storage areas should be designed so that each receptacle within the storage area is accessible to occupants/employees of the development (including people with disabilities)

- viii) Suitable wastewater drainage points should be installed in the receptacle storage area for cleaning and disinfecting purposes
- ix) Waste storage areas should not present any safety risks to users and should be well-lit
- x) Adequate ventilation of waste storage areas so as to minimise odours and potential nuisance from vermin/flies.

## 8.4 Air Quality Monitoring and Noise Control

1. The construction of the development shall be managed in accordance with a Construction Management Plan, incorporating a Noise and Vibration Management Plan which shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing by the Planning Authority prior to commencement of development. This plan shall be developed with reference to the Code of Practice for Construction and Demolition produced by the Air Quality Monitoring and Noise Control Unit. The Construction Management Plan shall, inter alia, incorporate the provisions set out below:

#### Noise Control- Demolition and Construction Phase

- Prior to demolition taking place a residential notification procedure shall be drafted by the contractor subject to the approval of Dublin City Council. This procedure must fully inform all residents of sensitive premises in the area how and to what extent the demolition works will impact upon them.
- Ongoing noise and vibration monitoring should be carried out during the demolition and construction phase. The monitoring points and methodology used should be subject to the approval of the Air Quality Monitoring and Noise Control Section. These results should be made available to Dublin City Council on request.
- The procedures for noise and vibration control as outlined in BS 5228: Code of Practice for noise and vibration control on construction and open sites Part 1 (BSI 2009) should be implemented in full.
- The hours of operation during the demolition and construction phase shall be restricted to 7.00am to 6pm, Monday to Friday, and 8.00am to 2.00pm on Saturdays. Permission to work outside of these hours must be subject to the approval of Dublin City Council.

#### Noise Control Operational Phase -General

• Noise levels from the proposed development shall not be so loud, so continuous, so repeated, of such duration or pitch or occurring at such times as to give reasonable cause for annoyance to a person in any premises in the neighbourhood or to a person lawfully using any public place.

- The LAeq level measured over 15 minutes (daytime) or 5 minutes (nighttime) at a noise sensitive premises when plant is operating on any land or building associated with the development, shall not exceed the LA90 (15 minutes day or 5 minutes night),by 5 dB(A) or more, measured from the same position, under the same conditions and during a comparable period with no plant in operation.
- Noise attenuation measures set out in the EIS accompanying this application shall be incorporated in respect of building services (11.6.2.1) and shall be maintained to ensure noise levels are not elevated above original design levels.

## Air Quality Control- Demolition and Construction Phase

- Adequate dust/debris screening should be in place at the site boundary to contain and minimise the amount of wind blown dust. These must be maintained in good condition at all times, and repairs made when necessary.
- Dust suppression equipment must be used where point source emissions are likely.
- A wheel wash should be in place and used at the entry and exit of the site to minimise dust created by the movement of vehicles. The entry and exit points to the site should be constructed of hard standing, which is regularly dampened to minimise dust nuisance.
- All consignments containing material with the potential to cause an air pollution nuisance being transported by skips, lorries, trucks and tippers must be covered during transit on and off site.
- The entire site should be dampened as necessary to minimise/prevent windblown dust. This shall include the daily washing down of pavements or other public areas to prevent dust nuisance.
- The occupier shall ensure that the areas around the site, including the public routes are regularly and adequately swept and cleaned to prevent any accumulation of dust and dirt.
- If requested by Dublin city council ongoing particulate monitoring should be carried out during the demolition phase. The monitoring points and methodology used should be subject to the approval of the Air Quality Monitoring and Noise Control Section. These results should be made available to Dublin City Council on request
- A study shall be carried out by a competent person subject to Dublin City Councils approval to determine if there is any asbestos in the buildings to be demolished or adapted. The report shall be made available to Dublin City Council before work commences. Prior to the demolition of the existing structures / buildings on the site, a written method statement for the management of the removal and disposal of any asbestos materials in the roofs or any other part of the structures by a specialist and licensed

contractor, shall be submitted by the applicant directly to the City Council's Air Quality Monitoring and Noise Control Section for its written agreement, and such agreement shall be obtained before any removal / demolition works are carried out.

# Air Quality Control -General

xi) No emissions, including odours, from the activities carried on at the address associated with the development shall result in an impairment of, or an interference with amenities or the environment beyond the site boundary or any other legitimate uses of the environment beyond.

## 8.5 Drainage

The following Conditions are recommended:

- All drainage elements shall be constructed in accordance with both the Engineer's Report and Flood Risk Assessment Report compiled by Arups and submitted with this planning application.
- All drainage shall be designed and constructed on the Completely Separate System with Stormwater being attenuated and Sustainable Drainage Systems (Suds) being utilised

Declan Wallace Assistant Chief Executive 25<sup>th</sup> April 2017

# Appendix 1 Roads and Traffic Planning Division Report

# **ROADS & TRAFFIC PLANNING DIVISION**

19<sup>th</sup> of April 2017

LODGED PLAN NO:	PARTX/0018	DATE LODGED:	10 <sup>th</sup> March 2017	
LOCATION:	St Vincent's University Hospital, Elm Park, Dublin 4			
PROPOSED:	National Maternity Hospital			
FOR:	Health Service	Executive		

# **ROADS & TRAFFIC PLANNING DIVISION REPORT**

## Proposed Development

This is an application for Strategic Infrastructure under Section 37E of the Planning and Development Act.

The proposed development comprises of:

Planning permission for a period of 10 no. years for the development of the new National Maternity Hospital, comprising: a 244 no. bed maternity hospital; developments for St Vincent's University Hospital (including 38 no. in-patient beds) to replace existing facilities on site; new campus wide shared non-clinical support services; a shared service yard, an extension to the existing multi-storey car park and all ancillary site development, site services, utilities and landscaping works ("the proposed development"), all at the St. Vincent's University Hospital Campus, Elm Park, Dublin 4, D04 T6F4.

The proposed development will consist of a series of developments on a 10.55 ha. site on the St. Vincent's University Hospital campus. The key elements of the proposed development of relevance to this division include the following:

- The construction of a new 50,776 sq.m. gross floor area building to be developed on a site at the eastern end of the St. Vincent's University Hospital Campus adjacent to and connected with the St. Vincent's Clinical Services building.
- The expansion of the existing multi-storey car park. The enhanced facility will provide a net increase of 277 no. space on the campus in addition to 149 no. displaced spaces to accommodate a total of 922 no. spaces over five levels.
- The demolition of existing buildings comprising 8,765 sq.m.

- The construction of: two new single storey bicycle store enclosures (170 sq.m. and 158 sq.m.) located to the south of the existing Nurse Education Centre for 192 no. bicycle spaces which in conjunction with new covered and convenience cycle spaces dispersed across the Campus will provide a net increase of 235 no. bicycle spaces, providing a total of 485 no. bicycle spaces on the Campus
- Proposed modifications to existing road junctions at Nutley Lane and Merrion Road (subject to the approval of the roads authority), a temporary construction access from Nutley Lane and general landscaping modifications to campus access routes.

# **RTPD Comments**

## Pre application Consultation

Pre application consultation was undertaken with this division prior to the submission of the planning application. The following points were discussed at pre application meetings:

- Principle of the development;
- Internal layout and alterations;
- Car parking and Mobility Management;
- Alterations to junctions and road layout;

## Site Location and Proposed Development

St Vincent's University Campus is bounded by Merrion Road to the north east, by Nutley Lane to the north west and by Elm Park Golf club to the south and south-west.

The proposed new National Maternity Hospital comprises a 5-6 storey over part basement building with a gross floor area of 50,776 sq.m. and will be located at the eastern side of the hospital campus.

It is stated that the catchment area for the proposed National Maternity Hospital will remain as per the existing hospital at Holles Street which is primarily regional in nature.

Section 6.5 of the EIS identifies the following transport related elements of the development:

- 270 no. additional cycle parking space (increasing to 222 no. secure, sheltered cycle parking spaces provided on Campus);
- Upgrading of the internal pedestrian cycle track at the junction of Merrion Road/Nutley Lane
- Enhancement of the existing shuttle bus services UCD to DART
- Showers, lockers and changing facilities for staff
- Motorcycle parking in accordance with Development Plan standards
- An additional 277 no. car parking spaces within the campus
- New underground access to the multi-storey car park Level 1 and a new above ground access to the multi storey car park Level 6, replacing the existing Level 2 access

- Improvements to the campus access junctions at Nutley Lane and Merrion Road
- Two no. set down areas in from of the proposed hospital main entrance (one on either side of the main internal road)
- A new waste collection and delivery areas shared between the Adult hospital and the new National Maternity Hospital
- A taxi holding area with capacity for 6 taxis

### Environmental Impact Assessment

An Environmental Impact Statement has been submitted as part of the application. The submission notes that the EIS for the project has been prepared in accordance with EIA-specific and other relevant environmental legislation, guidance and advice notes.

Chapter 6 Traffic and Transportation has been examined by this division as outlined below. Other relevant documents submitted with the documents have also been examined and referred to.

The EIS describes the existing roads, traffic and transportation network in the context of the proposed development and also examines the various aspects of the construction and operational phases of the development which have the potential to impact on roads, traffic and transportation and the magnitude of these impacts is considered. Mitigation measures are then described and the residual impact post mitigation measures are outlined. The Roads and Traffic Planning Division is satisfied with the 'substance' of information submitted as part of the EIS.

#### <u>Access</u>

Access to the St Vincent's Hospital Campus is currently provided via Merrion Road and Nutley Lane. Vehicular access to the proposed National Maternity Hospital will be provided via the Merrion Road and Nutley Lane entrances.

### Proposed Junction Improvements

The proposed development comprises of modifications to the existing road junctions at Nutley Lane and Merrion Road (subject to the approval of the planning authority).

The Proposed Site Layout Plan (Drawing no. NCH\_OCM\_A\_DR\_PA\_011) submitted in conjunction with the application illustrates indicative works both Merrion Road and Nutley Lane subject to the agreement of DCC.

The proposed Merrion Road Junction Improvements are illustrated on Drawing no. NMH\_ARU\_T\_DR\_PA\_002 prepared by ARUP Consulting Engineers illustrates the specific details of improvements proposed to Merrion Road. These works are located outside of the planning application boundary and include the following:

- Existing signal controlled entrance to be modified;
- Left turn slip lane and island to be removed;
- Pedestrian crossings and signals to be relocated;

The proposed junction improvements to Nutley Lane are illustrated on Drawing no. NMH\_ARU\_T\_DR\_PA\_001. These works include the following:

- Removal of the existing 8 no. on street car parking spaces along Nutley Lane;
- Existing carriageway to be remarked to provide a dedicated right turn lane;
- Existing signal controlled entrance to be modified to allow for longer right turn egress lane;

Prior to the commencement of development the applicant shall liaise with the Environment and Transportation Department in respect of the proposed works to Merrion Road and Nutley Lane. Any revisions to the adjoining road network including provision of right turning lanes and removal of on-street car parking where necessary shall be agreed with the Environment and Transportation Department prior to the commencement of development.

### Car Parking

A summary of the existing and proposed car parking provision is set out within Section 6.4.7 of the Traffic and Transportation Chapter of the EIS. This outlines that existing car parking available to the campus comprises parking within the campus, external on street parking spaces and external private car parks.

Table 6.4 of the Traffic and Transportation Study outlines that there are approximately 1,012 car parking spaces on the campus associated with the existing hospital and a further 306 spaces associated with St. Vincent's Private Hospital (278 no.), the mortuary (22no.) and ambulance bays (6no.).

Of the existing spaces 559 are staff spaces, 411 are visitor spaces and 42 are disabled spaces. In addition to the campus spaces, approximately 70 spaces are rented by St Vincent's University Hospital from Old Belvedere Rugby Club.

In addition pay and display parking is provided along Nutley Lane and Merrion Road and their associated side streets including Nutley Road, Elm Park, Nutley Avenue, Merrion Avenue, Sydney Parade Avenue, Ailesbury Park, Herbert Avenue and Estate Avenue.

It is stated in the EIS that the existing car parks within the Campus are actively managed. The peak car parking demand is identified between 10.00 and 15.00.

The application site is located within Parking Area 2 as identified within Map J of the Dublin City Development Plan. Table 16.1 of the City Development Plan identifies a maximum parking standard of 1 space per 100sq.m. gfa of hospital floorspace in parking area 2. On this basis a maximum of 508 no. spaces could be provided to serve the proposed hospital.

An additional 277 car parking spaces are proposed as part of the subject application. This additional parking is accommodated through the vertical and horizontal expansion of the existing multi storey car park. This quantum of additional parking is considered acceptable. It is acknowledged that there is an overall quantum of car parking available on campus. Proactive Mobility Management shall ensure that adequate car parking spaces are available for visitor and shift workers.

### Existing Traffic Patterns

Traffic counts on the surrounding road network were undertaken on the 15<sup>th</sup> of October 2014. Further surveys were undertaken on the 18<sup>th</sup> of January 2017. The

scope of the traffic surveys was agreed in advance with this division. These counts established current traffic conditions and existing distribution of trips on the local road network.

The traffic counts show that the surrounding road network is busy with congestion and queuing experienced during peak periods. The am peak on the local road network is identified between 07.45 and 08.45 and the pm peak is identified between 17.45 and 18.45. The Stillorgan Road is identified as the busiest link on the surrounding road network during the am and pm peak with over 3,800 no. vehicles recorded between 07.45 and 08.45 and 4,000 no. vehicles recorded during the pm peak. Merrion Road also experiences high traffic flows during the am and pm peak.

The morning and evening peaks for the hospital campus differ from those on the local road network. The campus am peak is identified between 07.00 and 08.00 and the pm peak is between 16.00 and 17.00, a further mid-day peak is identified between 14.00 and 15.00. A summary of the traffic counts on the local road network are summarised in Table 6.3 of the EIS.

In this regard it is stated that vehicular trips associated with St.Vincent's Hospital only correspond to a small part of the traffic on the local road network.

### Traffic Impact

Section 6.6.3.1 of the Traffic Assessment assesses the projected number of vehicles that will be generated by the new National Maternity Hospital on the basis of the provision of an additional 277 car parking spaces for staff, patients and visitors and the implementation of the Mobility Management Strategy.

Table 6.10 sets out the following trip generation at the Campus peak hours.

### Table 6.10: Traffic Generation Campus Peak

	Campus AM Peak		Campus PM Peak	
	Entry	Exit	Entry	Exit
Existing no. of trips	686	176	173	544
Rate per space	0.54	0.14	0.14	0.43
Estimated NMH Trips	148	38	37	118

Table 6.11 sets out the following traffic generation levels as a result of the proposed development on the local road network.

### Table 6.11: Traffic Generation Road Network Peak

	Campus AM Peak		Campus PM Peak	
	Entry	Exit	Entry	Exit
Existing no. of trips	465	239	173	270
Rate per space	0.36	0.19	0.13	0.21
Estimated NMH Trips	100	52	37	58

The TTA outlines that there is a higher level of two-way trips associated with the proposed NMH during the Campus AM and PM peak periods. It is stated that these trips occur when the volume of traffic on the surrounding road network is lower.

Traffic generated by the proposed development is distributed to the local road network based on the current distribution of traffic associated with the existing hospital campus. The assignment of traffic between the two Campus entrances at Merrion Road and Stillorgan Road is summarised below:

# Nutley Lane Entrance

- AM peak 66-69% of traffic enters and exits via the Nutley Lane entrance
- PM peak 55-65% of traffic enters and exits via the Nutley Lane entrance

# Merrion Road Entrance

- AM peak 34%-31% of traffic enters and exits via the Merrion Road entrance
- PM peak 35%-45% of traffic enters and exits via the Merrion Road entrance

The projected increase in traffic generated by the development during the Campus peak is less than 3.5% on all links apart from a section of Nutley Lane (between the R138 and the Campus Entrance) where the increase is a maximum of 9.1% during the morning period and 6.9% during the evening period.

Likewise the impact of the projected traffic flows during the local road network peaks is less than 2.5% on all roads apart from a section of Nutley Lane (between the R138 Stillorgan Road and the Campus entrance) where the increase is a maximum of 5.5% during the morning peak hour and 4.8% during the evening peak hour.

The traffic impact assessment concludes that the proposed NMH will have a "not significant to slight impact" on the adjoining road network during both the Campus peak hours and the road network peak hours.

A junction analysis is presented in Table 6.16 of the traffic assessment. The following junctions are analysed in this regard:

- R138 Stillorgan Road/Nutley Lane 1.9% increased during am peak and 1.1% during pm peak
- Merrion Road/Ailesbury Road 1.8% increase during am peak and 1.3% increase during pm peak
- Merrion Road/Nutley Lane 2% increase during am peak and 1.4% increase during pm peak
- Merrion Road/Strand Road 1.2% increase during am peak and 0.9% impact during pm peak
- Merrion Road/Campus Entrance 3.4% increase during am peak and 2.4% increase during pm peak
- Nutley Lane/ Campus Entrance 6.8% impact during am peak and 6.3% impact during pm peak.

A number of junctions on the surrounding road network have been analysed using the junction analysis software LinSig. A capacity analysis is undertaken of the following junctions within the EIS:

- R138 Stillorgan Road/Nutley Lane;
- R118 Merrion Road/Nutley Lane;
- R118 Merrion Road/Campus Entrance;
- Nutley Lane/Campus Entrance;

These junctions were considered either because of the levels of traffic increases as a result of the new development or in light of their performance in the local road network. Tables 6.17 to 6.20 of the EIS identifies limited increase in traffic during the am and pm Campus peak as a result of the proposed development. The proposed impact on the various junctions are identified as being imperceptible to slight on the various junctions.

The TIA refers to improvements to the entrance to the campus from Merrion Road and Nutley Lane which would result in a more efficient traffic movements. Any works to the public road including removal/relocation of car parking and provision of right turning lanes as may be required by DCC shall be carried out at the applicant's expense at no cost to Dublin City Council and to the detailed requirements of the Environment and Transportation Department.

### Mobility Management

Section 6.5 of the EIS identifies mobility management measure looks to build upon and enhance the measures and initiatives already in place on Campus.

Detailed measures to promote walking, cycle and use of public transport to the Campus are identified within the Mobility Management Plan. The continued active promotion of mobility management measures is welcomed.

During pre application discussions it was demonstrated that there is a proactive mobility management approach on campus. Dublin City Council will work closely with the overall campus to continue to promote modal split. The campus is also an active partner in the NTA Smarter Travel workplaces programme.

## Cycle Parking

Within the hospital campus cycle lanes are provided along the main internal streets.

Cycle parking standards are set out within Table 16.2 of the City Development Plan. This sets out a requirement for 1 space per 5 beds for hospital developments in Area 2. The proposed Maternity Hospital comprises 244 no. beds. On this basis there is a requirement for 49 no. cycle parking spaces. 270 no. additional cycle parking spaces are proposed within the subject application. This level of cycle parking provision is welcomed.

The proposed additional cycle parking spaces are proposed within two new single storey bicycle store enclosures (170 sq.m. and 158 sq.m.) located to the south of the existing Nurse Education Centre.

## Cycle Route

The Rock Road/Merrion Road corridor is identified as a Primary Cycle Route within the GDA Cycle Network Plan. The NTA have recently published for consultation the Sandymount/Merrion to Blackrock Corridor Study which seeks to provide a high quality cycle route between Sandymount and Blackrock. Nutley Lane is also identified as a Secondary Cycle Route within the GDA Cycle Network Plan.

The applicant engaged with the NTA prior to the lodgement of the application. Correspondence from the NTA is attached as Appendix 1.2 of the Environmental Impact Statement. The correspondence from the NTA is dated the 29<sup>th</sup> of January 2016. The following points relate to the cycle facilities:

- The NTA correspondence outlines that a key objective of the emerging design for the Sandymount/Merrion to Blackrock Corridor Study will go to public consultation in the coming months.
- Nutley Lane forms an important link between UCD and the Sydney Parade Dart Station. The correspondence from the NTA confirms that initial designs for a two way cycle route along this route but further design and planning work is require before a final solution for this cycle link is selected.

It is noted that this correspondence is dated January 2016 in the interim period the NTA have published the draft corridor study for the Sandymount/Merrion to Blackrock Corridor Study. The NTA are currently reviewing submissions made during the initial consultation period.

It is noted that there are some differences in layout between the proposed development and the draft cycle layout. Notwithstanding, the proposed development does not preclude the delivery of the final layout design of the cycle route.

Prior to the commencement of development the applicant should liaise with the NTA in terms of their requirements for the road network adjoining the Hospital Campus including Merrion Road and Nutley Lane.

## Public Transport

The hospital is well served in terms of linkages to public transport including the Dart Station at Sydney Parade and frequent bus services along Merrion Road. <u>Construction Management Plan</u>

An initial Construction Management Plan is included in 6.6 of the Environmental Impact Statement. It is stated that during different stages of construction traffic will enter and egress the campus either via a proposed one-way construction route from Nutley Lane or from the Merrion Road entrance/exit.

Section 6.7.1 of the EIS refers to the preparation of a detailed Construction Traffic Management Plan on appointment of the main contractor for the development. Measures which will be included within the Plan include limited parking for construction staff, working hours outside of the road network peaks, construction of the multi storey car park in the initial stage of the projection, separation of construction traffic from general traffic associated with the Campus, management of construction vehicles on the public road and implementation of a Mobility Management Plan.

Prior to the commencement of development and on appointment of a contractor for the development the applicant shall submit a detailed Construction Management Plan for the written agreement of the Environment and Transportation department.

### Recommendations

This division has no objection to the principle of the proposed development subject to the following conditions: -

- 9) Prior to commencement of development and on appointment of the main contractor, the applicant shall submit for the written agreement of Environment and Transportation Department a detailed Construction Management Plan.
- 10) (a) The applicant shall undertake to implement the measures outlined in the Mobility Management Plan. The appointed Mobility Manager shall coordinate, implement, monitor and update the plan in consultation with the working group and steering group. The MMP shall be implemented to the requirements of the Environment and Transportation Department, Dublin City Council and the National Transport Authority.
  - (d) Prior to occupation of the development, the Mobility Manager shall liaise with Environment & Transportation Department regarding a strategy for promoting sustainable travel among staff particularly those relocating to St. Vincent's Hospital Campus.
  - (e) Six months post occupation campus wide staff travel surveys shall be undertaken and the results submitted to Environment and Transportation Department.
- 11) Prior to the commencement of development, the applicant shall liaise with the NTA in terms of the requirements for the proposed cycle lane provision along Merrion Road and Nutley Lane.
- 12) Prior to commencement of development the applicant shall submit for the written agreement of Environment and Transportation Department a Car Park Management Plan. The Car Park Management Plan shall detail how car parking for the entire St. Vincent's Hospital Campus shall be managed through signage and other appropriate physical measures to ensure segregation of parking by user (staff/visitor). The applicant shall regularly monitor the use of car parks and in particular access by staff to visitor car parks. The manner and frequency of monitoring shall be to the requirements of Environment and Transportation Department.
- 13) Prior to the commencement of development all works proposed on the public road network, shall be subject to written agreement and approval from the Environment and Transportation Department. Any works to the public road including removal/relocation of car parking and provision of right turning lanes as may be required by DCC shall be carried out at the applicant's expense at no cost to Dublin City Council and to the detailed requirements of the Environment and Transportation Department. All materials should be agreed in detail with Dublin City Council and should be in accordance with the document Construction Standards for Roads and Street Works in Dublin City Council.
- 14) The location of signage proposed on public roads as part of any wayfinding strategy shall be agreed in writing with the Planning and Environment & Transportation Departments of Dublin City Council prior to the commencement of development.

- 15) All costs incurred by Dublin City Council, including any repairs to the public road and services necessary as a result of the development, shall be at the expense of the developer.
- 16) The developer shall be obliged to comply with the requirements set out in the Code of Practice.

Stephanie Farrington

Brendan O'Brien

**Executive Planner** 

Acting Executive Manager (Traffic)

# Appendix 2 City Architect's Report

Rannóg Ailtire na Cathrach Seirbhísí Tithíochta agus Cónaithe Oifigí na Cathrach, An Ché Adhmaid, BÁC 8

> City Architect's Division Housing & Residential Services Civic Offices, Wood Quay, Dublin 8

T: +353 (1) 222 3527 F: +353 (1) 222 2084

### Memo

# Re: Proposed National Maternity Hospital at St. Vincent's University Hospital Architectural Assessment

To: Mary Conway, Siobhan O'Connor

Date: 20 April 2017

### Introduction

The following document comprises the City Architect's Division's comments on the planning application for the National Maternity Hospital, at St. Vincent's Hospital. The Division wishes to note that we were not invited to participate in any pre-planning discussions with regard to this development.

The application broadly comprises a 244 no. bed maternity hospital; developments for St. Vincent's University hospital to replace existing facilities on site; new campus wide shared non-clinical support services; a shared service yard, an extension to the exiting multi-storey carpark and all ancillary site development, site services, utilities and landscaping works. The new maternity hospital will be a major addition to the St. Vincent's University hospital (SVUH) campus, fulfilling part of a long term healthcare strategy to co-locate adult and maternity services on the site.

We have assessed the application on the architectural and urban design information contained in the following planning application documents: Volume 1, Documentation (specifically the Planning Report); Volume 4, EIS Photomontages; Volume 5, Reports (specifically the Design Report, and Site Capacity Study); Volume 6, Design Drawings.

It should be noted that this Architectural Assessment provides a general appraisal of the project proposal, and does not provide a specialist assessment of the design, size, location and arrangement of medical spaces to be provided as part of the clinical brief to service a modern maternity hospital facility.

The report has been set out under the following headings:

- 1. Urban Form
- 2. Architectural Design
- 3. Movement

- 4. Public Realm
- 5. Landscape
- 6. Site Capacity Study (Future Phasing)
- 7. Summary Conclusions
- 8. Recommendations

# 1. URBAN FORM

The two principle buildings proposed in the application are (a) the National Maternity Hospital building, and (b) the extended carpark.

(a) The National Maternity Hospital building

It is considered that the scale and form of the proposed National Maternity Hospital building is respectful to its existing context, particularly to St. Vincent's University Hospital (SVUH) adjacent. As noted in the application, there are a number of existing large developments along the Merrion Road, many with a campus type character, which assist in integrating the proposed development into the area. Due to its distance and setbacks from the adjoining roads and properties, particularly at Herbert Avenue, the proposed heights are considered appropriate, and are not deemed to be detrimental to the amenity of the surrounding area. The taller block proposed to the east of the National Maternity Hospital successfully bookends the development addressing Merrion Road.

(b) The extended carpark building

The application proposes to extend the existing carpark horizontally and vertically (in part), along Nutley Lane. While landscape screening is proposed to mitigate against the visual impact of this extension, it is considered that the proposed development in this application should not hinder the possible siting of a more appropriate building use to the north and in front of this carpark in the future, to better address the site's prominent corner location at the junction of Nutley Lane and Merrion Road. This issue will be addressed in more detail in the 'Site Capacity Study (Future Phasing)', in section 6 below.

## 2. ARCHITECTURAL DESIGN

## (a) Elevations

The proposed National Maternity Hospital building makes reference to the scale, form, materials and alignment of SVUH adjacent. The solid to void ratios of glazing and the pattern of fenestration are considered appropriate to the scale of the building and assist in animating the building facades. The oblique reveals to some of the windows, proposed screens, and vertical fin articulations also add further interest to the building and assist in breaking down the mass of the building.

(b) Materials

The proposed granite facades are respectful to Dublin's tradition of building civic buildings from stone, and will further connect the proposed National Maternity Hospital building to the recently constructed buildings of St. Vincent's University

Hospital, Breast Check, the Nutley Wing and St. Vincent's Private Hospital which are all clad in granite.

### (c) Details

Detailed construction drawings of the hospital have not been submitted with the application, hence no appraisal is being provided in this assessment.

(d) Connections

It is noted that the floor to floor heights of the proposed National Maternity Hospital building do not match those of the existing SVUH adjacent. Direct level access is provided at 4<sup>th</sup> floor level only to facilitate ease of transfer to operating theatres between the two buildings, with stepped/ramped connections provided at other floors. While it is regrettable that direct level access is not provided for on all floors, the location of lifts and stairs in the west side of the proposed National Maternity Hospital building would appear to facilitate stepped/ramped links or connections to be inserted between the two buildings if required at a later stage. As stated in the application, this 10m zone between the 2 buildings may also provide expansion space in the future for either theatre block.

(e) Functionality

A hospital is by its nature a closed, private function and the activities that will involve direct interaction with the street are the points of public access and orientation. A convenience store is located at the entrance to the proposed National Maternity Hospital building and a café located internally with access to an external courtyard. It is submitted that these functions could be swapped to provide improved animation and passive surveillance to the entrance area, however there may be operational reasons why this proposal may not be workable. It is noted that a female WC is located in a very prominent position in the atrium, on axis with the entrance. It is suggested that a less prominent location could be found elsewhere in the building for this use, so that the atrium remains a clear space.

It is noted that the design of the new Maternity Hospital allows for future expansion and flexibility, through its structural grid and tall floor to floor heights of approximately 4.4m, which will allow internal reconfigurations and extensions if required in the future.

### (f) Wayfinding

The main entrance to the proposed National Maternity Hospital building will be clearly defined along the main SVUH campus spine road by the provision of a forecourt addressing a new central plaza within the hospital campus. The taller L-shaped corner block to the northeast of the proposed hospital will also frame the entrance to the hospital with a canopy and colonnade adjacent. This entrance provides access into a central atrium which is located between the two new blocks proposed as part of the National Maternity Hospital building; a 5/6 storey block to the west, and a 6/7 storey block running perpendicular to the west. From the central atrium, visitors and patients are orientated through the hospital along orthogonal circulation routes interspersed with landscape courtyards, providing a clear and legible hierarchy of vertical circulation cores, hospital streets and departmental corridors.

The atrium appears large and bright. There is a sense of space throughout the building, provided by generous floor areas, tall ceiling heights and high levels of natural light through the provision of atria and expansive glazing to the courtyards. Expansive views are provided from many of the bedroom windows to Dublin Bay and the Dublin Mountains. A number of distinguishable features such as feature stairs, lift shafts, internal courtyards etc animate the internal spaces and provide visual cues and wayfinding points.

The entrance to the emergency section at the east side of the proposed National Maternity Hospital building is perhaps less evident, particular if accessing the hospital campus from Nutley Lane. It is assumed however that patients using this emergency entrance will generally arrive by ambulance rather than using their own private transport.

## 3. MOVEMENT

The development proposes to upgrade a number of existing access routes into the hospital campus to improve permeability. The creation of a new additional access route and entrance to the multi-storey car parking block off Merrion Road is well-considered and will facilitate the amenity of the new Main Entrance Plaza, by removing through traffic running across the main SVUH campus spine road. Dedicated areas for set-down, emergency vehicles, disabled parking etc. are provided in the vicinity of the entrance area along the spine road.

The provision of a new cycle lane to run adjacent to the existing 'boulevard' northsouth public pedestrian route will also facilitate improved access to the hospital campus, linking the intersection of Merrion Road, Nutley Lane and Merrion Shopping Centre to the north with the new Main Entrance Plaza within the hospital campus to the south.

## 4. PUBLIC REALM

A new Main Entrance Plaza with shared surfaces is proposed to the north of the new National Maternity Hospital building, with the main SVUH campus spine road running through it. The plaza is deemed to be appropriate in scale, design and material to the proposed new building and will act as a central anchor space for the entire hospital campus when fully developed out, as described in the application's 'Site Capacity Study'. It is noted that both main entrances to the National Maternity Hospital and St. Vincent's University Hospital will be located off the main SVUH campus spine road, which will act as a new central main street within the hospital campus when fully developed out. Improvements to vehicular, cyclist and pedestrian movement on the hospital campus will assist in the delivery of a traffic-calmed high quality public realm in this area.

The new Main Entrance Plaza within the hospital campus will also have improved access and connection to the junction of the Merrion Road, Nutley Lane and Merrion Shopping Centre to the north, via the existing north-south public pedestrian route and the provision of a new cycle route adjacent. It is submitted that there is an opportunity at this northern end of the hospital site to provide for an enlarged public plaza addressing this important junction and assist in place-making and integrating the hospital campus into the adjoining urban area.

Due to consideration has been given to universal access requirements in the design of the scheme.

## 5. LANDSCAPE

Proposals to green the carpark building with climbing plants, hedges and trees are welcome and will assist in softening the appearance of this building addressing Nutley Lane and its intersection with Merrion Road. A stainless steel wire trellis and planting screen is proposed to run along the southern face of the carpark, however it is submitted, that this trellis and planting screen should be provided on all sides of the carpark to completely merge the carpark building into the landscape.

A number of planted atria, courtyards, and balconies are proposed throughout the scheme which improves the visual amenity of the building. It is noted that a number of roofs in the new National Maternity Hospital building contain green sedum type roofs/planting, while others do not contain any such greening proposals.

# 6. SITE CAPACITY STUDY (FUTURE PHASING)

The application contains a 'Site Capacity Study' which has been prepared to test the capacity of the campus to accommodate future development, including provision for a 20% expansion of adult and maternity services. The study describes the proposed phasing of developments across the entire hospital campus in a planned and orderly manner, and intends to demonstrate that current proposals will not compromise or jeopardise any of these planned future developments. It is noted that this study is indicative only: it does not purport to be a development plan, but rather an indication of its potential capacity. Alternative approaches could also be considered.

Whilst not the immediate subject of this application, it is considered that the 'Site Capacity Study' should also address and demonstrate how the development of the entire hospital campus will better integrate with its existing urban context in the future, rather than remaining as a standalone insular campus development. It is acknowledged that the primary considerations for the proposals are to safeguard the current and future development of the hospital campus, however it is considered that more attention needs to be given to the site's boundaries and edges, and how the hospital's future developments will assist in improving the urban form, visual quality and streetscape of the area. The northern boundary of the hospital site along Nutley Lane and Merrion Road in particular needs careful and sensitive consideration, as the intersection of these roads creates a very visually prominent junction along a key economic corridor to the city.

It is regrettable that the existing carparking block for the hospital campus is located adjacent to the northern boundary, rather than in a more concealed location elsewhere on the campus. The majority of the existing buildings on the campus are proposed for demolition as part of the future development of the hospital, however the Study indicates that the car parking building is to remain. It is considered that carparking could be located elsewhere in the campus, e.g. to the south or southeast, or perhaps underground as part of new developments. The current application seeks to extend this carpark horizontally and vertically, and it is likely that this block will need to be extended further to accommodate the parking needs of the expanded hospital as it develops further in the future.

It is submitted that the 'Site Capacity Study' should include indicative blocks that could be constructed at a future stage to address the full length of both Nutley Lane and Merrion Road. Section 4.2: Opportunity Zones, and Section 6.0: SVUH Campus Activity Assessment in the 'Site Capacity Study' provides an overview of proposals for different future development zones within the campus. The Zone 5 site

addressing Merrion Road makes reference to the possibility of providing buildings with direct street access to create a more urban street frontage to the hospital. However it is noted that the carparking block is not zoned for any future redevelopment in the Study; it is considered that some blocks could potentially be constructed to address Nutley Lane on the margin of land immediately to the north of the carparking block, or possibly over the carpark building itself if required (it is noted that there is an existing Dodder valley sewer wayleave in this area which would need to be addressed) under a proposed new Zone (e.g. Zone 7) that could be created in the Study. These blocks could include additional medical facilities or nurses' accommodation for the hospital or a mixed use development with commercial / retail uses. Blocks could also be located to abut the carpark building immediately to the south to address and reinforce the urban quality of the main SVUH campus spine road.

There is an opportunity also to create an enlarged area of public realm at the northernmost end of the hospital site to provide further amenity and activity to this space.

In addition to demonstrating the development and future phasing of the entire hospital campus, the 'Site Capacity Study' presents an opportunity therefore to demonstrate how its future development will enhance and consolidate the area's urban form generally, to create a new district urban centre with attractive and animated streetscapes.

## 7. SUMMARY CONCLUSIONS

In general, the development appears to be well considered, and it is deemed that no major issues are perceived with the development as currently proposed.

## 8. RECOMMENDATIONS

The 'Site Capacity Study' should address how the proposed development of the hospital campus in the future will better engage, enhance and connect with the existing urban context where it interfaces with Nutley Lane, Merrion Road and the Merrion Shopping Centre. The lands all along Nutley Lane and immediately to the north of the carparking block in particular could be identified as an 'Opportunity Zone' with development proposals included as part of the Study, as outlined in Section 6 above.

Signed

Ali Grehan City Architect

# Appendix 3 Waste Management Division Report

# WASTE REGULATION SECTION - WASTE MANAGEMENT DIVISION

Application No:	PARTX/0018, St. Vincent's University Hospital Campus
Location:	St. Vincent's University Hospital Campus, Elm Park, Dublin 4 D04 T6F4,
Proposal:	Development of the new National Maternity Hospital at St Vincent's University Hospital Campus
Date:	20/03/2017

## Waste Regulation Section, Waste Management Division Comments:

### Report to Planning Department C661 Construction and Demolition Projects (Larger Projects) C661

a. Prior to the commencement of any works, a Construction and Demolition Waste Management Plan must be furnished to and approved by Dublin City Council having regard

to Circular WPR 07/06 - Best Practice Guidelines on the Preparation of Waste Management

Plans for Construction and Demolition Projects - published by the DECLG, July 2006

b. In the event that hazardous soil, or historically deposited waste is encountered during the

construction phase, the contractor must notify Dublin City Council and provide a Hazardous/Contaminated Soil Management Plan, to include estimated tonnages, description of location, any relevant mitigation, destination for disposal/treatment, in

addition to information on the authorised waste collector(s).

c. Prior to the commencement of any storage of waste on-site, the applicant must consult with the Waste Regulation Unit of Dublin City Council.

d. Monthly reports regarding the management of the waste during works, must be forwarded electronically to the Waste Regulation Unit of Dublin City Council <u>waste.regulation@dublincity.ie</u>

e. The works must comply with the following:

i) Waste Management Act 1996, as amended

Dublin City Council Waste Bye-Laws 2013 (Bye-Laws for the storage, presentation and collection of Household and Commercial waste)or any revision thereof.

ii) Eastern & Midlands Regional Waste Management Plan 2015-2021.

iii) Best Practice Guidelines on the Preparation of Waste Management Plans for the Construction and Demolition Projects – DECLG 2006.

iv) Waste Management (Hazardous Waste) (Amendment) Regulations S.I. No 73/2000

v) National Hazardous Waste Management Plan 2014-2020

vi) Article 27 of the European (Waste Directive) Regulations S.I. No 126 of 2011

vii) Any other relevant Waste Management related regulations

viii) Dublin City Development Plan (Current Version)

### C672 Waste (Standards for Commercial/Industrial Developments) C672

a. The requirements set out in the Bye-Laws for the Storage, Presentation and Collection of Household and Commercial Waste, 2013 or any revision thereof must be adhered to and, in particular, the requirement to segregate waste into separate fractions to facilitate the collection of dry recyclables, organic kitchen/garden waste and residual waste in line with Waste Management (Food Waste) Regulations 2009 (S.I. 508/2009), and the Waste Management (Food Waste) Amendment Regulations S.I. 190 of 2015, and the Eastern - Midlands Region Waste Management Plan 2015-2021.

b. The following are also requirements:

i) Receptacles that are designed for reuse, with the exception of in specific areas designated by a local authority as being only suitable for the collection of non-reusable receptacles such as bags, ideally of 1,100L capacity, must be used.

ii) Adequate storage space for a minimum of 1 No. 1,100 Litre receptacle.

iii) Sufficient space must be provided to accommodate the separate collection of dry recyclables and organic food/garden waste.

iv) Adequate space and height for a standard Refuse Collection Vehicle (RCV) to access site.

v) Sufficient access and egress must be provided to enable receptacles to be moved easily from the storage area to an appropriate collection point on the public street nearby.

vi) Receptacle storage areas must not be visible from or on a public street.

vii) The receptacle storage areas should be designed so that each receptacle within the storage area is accessible to occupants/employees of the development (including people with disabilities)

viii) Suitable wastewater drainage points should be installed in the receptacle storage area for cleaning and disinfecting purposes

ix) Waste storage areas should not present any safety risks to users and should be well-lit

x) Adequate ventilation of waste storage areas so as to minimise odours and potential nuisance from vermin/flies.

# Appendix 4 Air Quality Monitoring and Noise Control Unit Report

This Unit has the following comments to make with respect to this application.

If permission is granted for this development it is recommended the following conditions are attached to the permission:

The construction of the development shall be managed in accordance with a Construction Management Plan, incorporating a Noise and Vibration Management Plan which shall be submitted to, and agreed in writing by the Planning Authority prior to commencement of development. This plan shall be developed with reference to the Code of Practice for Construction and Demolition produced by the Air Quality Monitoring and Noise Control Unit. The Construction Management Plan shall, inter alia, incorporate the provisions set out below:

# **Noise Control- Demolition and Construction Phase**

- Prior to demolition taking place a residential notification procedure shall be drafted by the contractor subject to the approval of Dublin City Council. This procedure must fully inform all residents of sensitive premises in the area how and to what extent the demolition works will impact upon them.
- Ongoing noise and vibration monitoring should be carried out during the demolition and construction phase. The monitoring points and methodology used should be subject to the approval of the Air Quality Monitoring and Noise Control Section. These results should be made available to Dublin City Council on request.
- The procedures for noise and vibration control as outlined in BS 5228: Code of Practice for noise and vibration control on construction and open sites Part 1 (BSI 2009) should be implemented in full.
- The hours of operation during the demolition and construction phase shall be restricted to 7.00am to 6pm, Monday to Friday, and 8.00am to 2.00pm on Saturdays. Permission to work outside of these hours must be subject to the approval of Dublin City Council.

## **Noise Control Operational Phase -General**

- Noise levels from the proposed development shall not be so loud, so continuous, so repeated, of such duration or pitch or occurring at such times as to give reasonable cause for annoyance to a person in any premises in the neighbourhood or to a person lawfully using any public place.
- The LAeq level measured over 15 minutes (daytime) or 5 minutes (nighttime) at a noise sensitive premises when plant is operating on any land or building associated with the development, shall not exceed the LA90 (15 minutes day or 5 minutes night),by 5 dB(A) or more, measured from the same position, under the same conditions and during a comparable period with no plant in operation.

 Noise attenuation measures set out in the EIS accompanying this application shall be incorporated in respect of building services (11.6.2.1) and shall be maintained to ensure noise levels are not elevated above original design levels.

## Air Quality Control- Demolition and Construction Phase

- Adequate dust/debris screening should be in place at the site boundary to contain and minimise the amount of wind blown dust. These must be maintained in good condition at all times, and repairs made when necessary.
- Dust suppression equipment must be used where point source emissions are likely.
- A wheel wash should be in place and used at the entry and exit of the site to minimise dust created by the movement of vehicles. The entry and exit points to the site should be constructed of hard standing, which is regularly dampened to minimise dust nuisance.
- All consignments containing material with the potential to cause an air pollution nuisance being transported by skips, lorries, trucks and tippers must be covered during transit on and off site.
- The entire site should be dampened as necessary to minimise/prevent windblown dust. This shall include the daily washing down of pavements or other public areas to prevent dust nuisance.
- The occupier shall ensure that the areas around the site, including the public routes are regularly and adequately swept and cleaned to prevent any accumulation of dust and dirt.
- If requested by Dublin city council ongoing particulate monitoring should be carried out during the demolition phase. The monitoring points and methodology used should be subject to the approval of the Air Quality Monitoring and Noise Control Section. These results should be made available to Dublin City Council on request
- A study shall be carried out by a competent person subject to Dublin City Councils approval to determine if there is any asbestos in the buildings to be demolished or adapted. The report shall be made available to Dublin City Council before work commences. Prior to the demolition of the existing structures / buildings on the site, a written method statement for the management of the removal and disposal of any asbestos materials in the roofs or any other part of the structures by a specialist and licensed contractor, shall be submitted by the applicant directly to the City Council's Air Quality Monitoring and Noise Control Section for its written agreement, and such agreement shall be obtained before any removal / demolition works are carried out.

# Air Quality Control -General

No emissions, including odours, from the activities carried on at the address associated with the development shall result in an impairment of, or an interference with amenities or the environment beyond the site boundary or any other legitimate uses of the environment beyond the site boundary.

Gerry Osborne Environmental Health Officer Air Quality Monitoring & Noise Control Unit | Environment & Transportation Department Block 3, Floor 1, Civic Offices, Dublin 8

# Appendix 5 Drainage Division Report

Planning & Developer Services | Asset Management | Environment and Transportation Department | Dublin City Council Floor 4 Block 1 | Civic Offices | Wood Quay | Dublin 8 Tel: 01- 2222414

<u>Memo</u>

Re: Proposed National Maternity Hospital at St. Vincent's University Hospital, Elm Park, Dublin 4.

Date: 25<sup>th</sup> April 2017

This is the Report of the Drainage Division:

There is No Objection to this proposal, subject to all drainage elements being constructed in accordance with both the Engineer's Report and Flood Risk Assessment Report compiled by Arups and submitted with this planning application.

All drainage must be designed and constructed on the Completely Separate System with Stormwater being attenuated and Sustainable Drainage Systems (Suds) being utilised.

*Gerry Doherty* Senior Executive Engineer